



CITY OF JACKSONVILLE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION
COMMISSION

Proceedings held on Wednesday, July 27, 2016,
commencing at 3:00 p.m., Ed Ball Building, 214 North
Hogan Street, 8th Floor, Jacksonville, Florida, before
Diane M. Tropia, a Notary Public in and for the State of
Florida at Large.

PRESENT:

DAVID B. CASE, Chair.
JENNIFER MANSFIELD, Vice Chair.
ANGELA SCHIFANELLA, Secretary.
JOHN ALLMAND, Commission Member.
BARRY B. UNDERWOOD, Commission Member.
SEARCY C. DANNHEIM, Commission Member.
CORA HACKLEY, Commission Member.

ALSO PRESENT:

JOEL McEACHIN, Planning and Development Dept.
LISA SHEPPARD, Planning and Development Dept.
AUTUMN MARTINAGE, Planning and Development Dept.
BLAIR MULLINS, Planning and Development dept.
SONDRA FETNER, Office of General Counsel.
GLORIA BLAKE, Planning and Development Dept.

- - -

Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300



1 THE CHAIRMAN: I have a motion and a
 2 second to approve 3872 Valencia Road,
 3 COA-16-530, with the condition of an
 4 additional condition, making the cheek wall the
 5 same as the adjacent column.
 6 I have a motion and a second.
 7 All in favor?
 8 COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
 9 THE CHAIRMAN: Those opposed?
 10 COMMISSION MEMBERS: (No response.)
 11 THE CHAIRMAN: Seeing none, you have
 12 approved COA-16-530.
 13 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I'd just like to
 14 thank the gentleman for coming out here to
 15 speak because he had to take time off from work
 16 to come.
 17 And it is disturbing every once in a while
 18 when we have something like that that we look
 19 at and say it should have been on the
 20 contributing list, and it's not. And not
 21 having done any research in the matter myself,
 22 I think it's just a matter of we're all human.
 23 Unfortunately, some errors were made when the
 24 surveys were done and some things got missed.
 25 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Yeah. Was
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 minor alterations, temporary new construction,
 2 events and activities in the park will not
 3 require a COA. However, the following work
 4 will require a COA:
 5 Modifications being made to permanently
 6 change the use of any portion of the site in a
 7 way inconsistent with an urban public space.
 8 And Number 2, relocation, modification,
 9 restoration or other work conducted on the
 10 Confederate monument or the coquina marker
 11 commemorating Old Kings Road that's found in
 12 conflict, potentially in conflict, with the
 13 Secretary of Interior standards for
 14 rehabilitation.
 15 And, finally, the other recommendation we
 16 added was that any work which the Department
 17 determines to be in conflict or potentially in
 18 conflict with any applicable Secretary
 19 standards can require a COA and can be brought
 20 to the Commission.
 21 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
 22 MR. McEACHIN: The owner of the property
 23 is officially opposed to designation of the
 24 park in writing, which I hope I shared with
 25 y'all earlier. Therefore, the Commission, to
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 there a COA to demolish that building?
 2 MS. MARTINAGE: Yes.
 3 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. We'll move on to --
 4 we have no condemned properties. We'll move on
 5 to historic designations.
 6 MR. McEACHIN: That would be Hemming
 7 Plaza.
 8 I want to -- in doing this, we'll do
 9 something a little bit different. I want to
 10 state at the beginning about what the -- our
 11 report and recommendations, about what we're
 12 suggesting should be done as far as what
 13 requires a COA and what doesn't require a COA.
 14 I want to make sure it's on the record to be
 15 very clear for the Hemming Plaza designation.
 16 This designation application for Hemming
 17 Plaza was put together at the request of the
 18 Commission at the meeting on December the 9th
 19 of 2015. And, of course, if it is designated,
 20 if it's a recommended designation as a landmark
 21 site -- and, of course, it goes to City Council
 22 and is approved -- then certainly it will
 23 require a COA either from the Commission or
 24 from the Department.
 25 However, routine repairs and maintenance,
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 forward a recommendation to the City Council,
 2 the Commission is going to have to find that
 3 the park meet at least four of seven standards.
 4 In doing the -- in developing the
 5 application and doing the research, the
 6 Planning and Development Department determined
 7 that the park itself met four standards and
 8 that the Confederate monument met an additional
 9 standard as well. So that's a total of five.
 10 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Can I ask you a
 11 question while you're doing that, Joel?
 12 The owner, did they react to the -- are
 13 there two applications, one for the monument
 14 only and one for the monument and park, and did
 15 they react to those? Did they have a different
 16 opinion on those?
 17 MR. McEACHIN: The letter is very short.
 18 Can I read it into the record?
 19 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Yes, sir.
 20 MR. McEACHIN: This is addressed to
 21 Chairman Barry Underwood at the time. It is
 22 from Daryl Joseph, the Director of Parks and
 23 Recreation. And he states: Please accept this
 24 letter as the City of Jacksonville's opposition
 25 to the proposed landmark site designation for
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 Hemming Park.
 2 This opposition is only for the property
 3 that constitutes the park, all of Block 39, the
 4 heart of the city of Jacksonville. The City is
 5 not opposed for the consideration of landmark
 6 designations for any specific park feature such
 7 as a Confederate monument that would meet the
 8 appropriate criteria.

9 So continue?

10 THE CHAIRMAN: Please.

11 MR. McEACHIN: I'm going to try to be
 12 quick on discussing how the park meets the
 13 criteria since this information was put in
 14 detail in the report and also, of course, to
 15 save us the time and misery of having to hear
 16 me speak.

17 The first criteria is Number [sic] A, a
 18 significant reminder of the cultural,
 19 historical, architectural or archaeological
 20 heritage of the city, state or nation.

21 This two-acre parcel, known at different
 22 times as St. James Park, the City Park, Hemming
 23 Park and Hemming Plaza, has had many physical
 24 manifestations, but it has always maintained
 25 its original intent and size and use as a

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 Jacksonville produced by Isaiah Hart
 2 established the current street grid of downtown
 3 Jacksonville beyond the original 1822 plat.
 4 And as part of this platting, he set aside a
 5 block of land, Block 39, for a public square.

6 I believe it's so designated -- I'm not
 7 sure, because I can't see -- as a marketplace
 8 and general meeting area. And then, of course,
 9 he also subdivides some of the lots to allow
 10 for businesses that would front this public
 11 square.

12 The park stayed under the private
 13 ownership of the Hart Family until 1866, but
 14 even during the Civil War, there are records
 15 that the park was being used as a gathering
 16 place during the first and fourth occupation of
 17 Jacksonville by the Union Army. And a
 18 reconstruction era speech by Governor Marvin in
 19 1865.

20 And in January of 1866, the City of
 21 Jacksonville acquired the entire block,
 22 Block 39. It was sold to the City for \$10 by
 23 the executors of the Isaiah Hart Estate. And
 24 soon after, the St. James hotel opened. You
 25 can see it.

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 public gathering place.

2 And even before it became a park, it was a
 3 part of Jacksonville that was concerned with
 4 that, that parcel was.

5 As you can see here, the Old Kings Road,
 6 British Kings -- the British era Kings Road --
 7 again, this is not totally -- this is based on
 8 speculation, I assume, but the person who did
 9 this map has it just skirting that northeast
 10 corner of Hemming Park.

11 And then what's coming at -- coming from
 12 the west is the Alligator Road, which went to
 13 Lake City, which was called Alligator at the
 14 time in Tallahassee.

15 There is a coquina marker on that -- on
 16 that corner of Hemming Plaza, and it
 17 commemorates the -- this intersection of these
 18 two roads. The marker, I'm not sure how long
 19 the marker has been there. In 1928 -- it's a
 20 piece of coquina rock. In 1928, the
 21 Jacksonville Chapter of the National Society of
 22 Daughters of the American Revolution added this
 23 informational plaque to that little marker.

24 The 1859 Hart's map of Jacksonville -- I
 25 think it's that. Yeah. The 1859 Hart's map of

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 The park began to take on some appearance
 2 of a park. It was not yet developed. And
 3 perimeter fencing was put around it. And also,
 4 a little bandstand kind of thing in the center
 5 of the park itself. But after that, the park
 6 went downhill. There was no real changes made
 7 to it or improvements made to it.

8 It was considered a -- in one newspaper
 9 article, as a municipal eyesore. "The fence
 10 that once surrounded it has rotted down and had
 11 been carted off. The old pavilion is a trap
 12 that ere long will fall and kill someone."

13 Another article stated that the park is
 14 overgrown with weeds, inhabited by stray cows
 15 and pigs, and a gathering place for "bunko men"
 16 and prostitutes.

17 1866, the City made -- 1887 -- I'm
 18 sorry -- the City made its first appropriation
 19 to improve the park. They spent \$700 to put in
 20 some trails and to put in a fountain, put in a
 21 well and put in a fountain.

22 We're not sure if this is in response to
 23 the public shaming from the newspapers or the
 24 fact that the Subtropical Exposition [sic] was
 25 going to open that next year, and they did

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 bring a lot of people to Jacksonville,
 2 including President and Mrs. Grover Cleveland.
 3 Since 1898, the most prominent and
 4 enduring feature in Hemming Park is the
 5 Confederate monument, this 62-foot-high -- this
 6 62-foot-high marble, granite and bronze
 7 monument crowned the single confederate soldier
 8 gazing to the south, was a former Jacksonville
 9 resident and Confederate veteran, Charles C.
 10 Hemming.

11 Hemming was originally a member of the
 12 Jacksonville Light Infantry and later served as
 13 a sergeant in Company A of the Third Florida
 14 Infantry. He was captured in the Battle of
 15 Missionary Ridge in Tennessee and was taken to
 16 the notorious Rock Island prison in Illinois.

17 Once the War was over with, he moved to
 18 Texas and Colorado, made a fortune and decided
 19 to use some of that money to make a gift to the
 20 state of Florida and to Jacksonville of this
 21 monument in honor of the -- in memory of the
 22 Confederate veterans.

23 The monument was unveiled in a grand
 24 ceremony on June the 16th, 1898. It was in the
 25 middle of the Spanish-American War. The 7th
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 of 1901.
 2 After the fire, Hemming -- Hemming Park
 3 was cleaned up and new shrubbery, trees and
 4 grass were planted. It resumed its role as the
 5 heart of the city.

6 And its role as the -- its unofficial role
 7 as center of the city was particularly enhanced
 8 with construction of the St. James Building
 9 that opened in 1912. Of course, this is the
 10 large building that housed the Cohen Brothers
 11 big store designed by Henry John Klutho.

12 Because of its significant location
 13 fronting Hemming Park, the St. James Building,
 14 with its ever-changing window displays, its
 15 great variety of merchandise, popular
 16 restaurants, and offices up on the third --
 17 numerous professional offices up on the third
 18 and fourth floor, came to be recognized and
 19 treated as the center of downtown
 20 Jacksonville's retail and social life well into
 21 the 1960s.

22 Hemming Park also was a major political
 23 stump for speeches, rallies and free
 24 entertainment by candidates who ran for a
 25 variety of public offices -- offices on the
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 Army Corps that was stationed at Camp Cuba
 2 Libra, in a district east of Springfield,
 3 escorted members of the Confederate -- United
 4 Confederate Veterans to the park for the
 5 ceremony.

6 In attendance was Major General Fitzhugh
 7 Lee, Commander of the 7th Army, and the nephew
 8 of General Robert E. Lee. Also in attendance
 9 was the grandson of Ulysses S. Grant. The
 10 monument was dedicated to all Florida soldiers
 11 and sailors that served in the war, and it was
 12 officially accepted by Governor -- Governor
 13 William D. Bloxham.

14 Not too long after that, in 1899, the City
 15 of Jacksonville officially changed the name of
 16 the park from St. James Park to Hemming Park.

17 The monument also is the -- has the
 18 distinction of being the only structure to
 19 survive the Great Fire, that was in the path of
 20 the fire, that is, and able to survive
 21 completely intact. And after the fire, it was
 22 used to have a commissary for women. And also,
 23 I think there were some marines that were there
 24 to protect the women, I guess. And these tents
 25 were put up for about -- for most of the summer

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 local, state and national level.

2 Perhaps the most unusual political event
 3 to occur in Hemming Park was on October the
 4 18th, 1960, when the park hosted both
 5 presidential candidates. In the morning,
 6 Richard Nixon came and had a rally. In the
 7 afternoon, John F. Kennedy had a rally in
 8 Hemming Park.

9 The week before, vice president candidate
 10 Lyndon B. Johnson had addressed over 3,000
 11 people in Hemming Park. And he spoke again in
 12 October of 1964 when he ran for -- ran for the
 13 Office of President. His opponent, Senator
 14 Barry Goldwater, also made an appearance at the
 15 park.

16 The location of a significant local, state
 17 or national event, Hemming Park has, over time,
 18 become the epicenter of the Jacksonville civil
 19 rights movement of the early 1960s. These
 20 demonstrations and sit-ins that were done were
 21 organized and carried out by the Jacksonville
 22 Youth Council of the National Association for
 23 the Advancement of Colored People, the NAACP,
 24 under the leadership of local teacher and Youth
 25 Council advisor, Rutledge Pearson.

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 The most well known demonstration was "Axe
 2 Handle Saturday" that occurred on August the
 3 27th, 1960. And before the sit-in was even --
 4 it was already planned, before they got to
 5 downtown, the demonstrators were informed that
 6 a group of white men were in Hemming Park
 7 giving out axes and axe handles. I'm sorry.
 8 Axe handles and bats were being distributed.

9 The students agreed to go on with the
 10 demonstration, but they changed the location to
 11 the W.T. Grant store, which is located on the
 12 northwest corner the Main and Adams Street.

13 Of course, once they got into the Grant
 14 store and sat down at the counter, the manager
 15 turned the lights off, closed the store down.

16 So the demonstrators, who were mainly high
 17 school students, left, left the Grant store.
 18 When they came out, they were attacked by a
 19 group of white men using the bats and the axe
 20 handles and other things.

21 When this event occurred, there was no
 22 police presence during the attack. Soon
 23 thereafter, 200 police cars and fire trucks
 24 came and quickly moved into the area and
 25 restored order.

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 business appeal, the Jacksonville Chamber of
 2 Commerce and other community and religious
 3 leaders circumvented the lack of action by
 4 Mayor Haydon Burns and formed a biracial
 5 committee that began to address this issue.

6 Eventually, these efforts resulted in the
 7 integration of downtown restaurants, but I
 8 think the most important part of this action
 9 that occurred from the "Axe Handle Saturday"
 10 was that it created momentum in the city to
 11 address the other problems that had been an
 12 issue in the black communities, such as
 13 segregated and unequal educational
 14 opportunities, lack of neighborhood
 15 infrastructure, as well as the need for
 16 economic development.

17 Number C is identification with a person
 18 or persons who significantly contribute to the
 19 city, state or nation.

20 Hemming -- as I said earlier, Hemming Park
 21 and the associated street grid still being
 22 utilized today is a direct contribution of the
 23 productive life of Isaiah D. Hart, who is
 24 recognized as a founder of Jacksonville.

25 In the years following his death, Hart's
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 Many of the youths were actually escorted
 2 to safety by a black male group called the
 3 Boomerangs. And they actually lived in
 4 Blodgett homes, and they heard about this event
 5 occurring, and they came in and provided some
 6 guards and security to get these people out of
 7 that situation.

8 Sporadic violence and vandalism continued
 9 all through the day in different parts of the
 10 city, and even into the night. What's
 11 important about this event -- as you can see
 12 here, it was in Life Magazine. That photograph
 13 was from Life Magazine.

14 That gentleman that you see with the
 15 blood-spattered shirt, he was not part of the
 16 youth group. He actually was just downtown to
 17 do some shopping, and he got attacked.

18 The violent attacks on "Axe Handle
 19 Saturday" shocked the white community. It
 20 resulted in an effort to galvanize action,
 21 particularly by the business community.

22 To address race relations and concern
 23 about continued national exposure to
 24 Jacksonville and -- to Jacksonville's negative
 25 racial climate and its impact on Jacksonville's

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 contribution to Jacksonville became best known,
 2 and was not widely recognized publicly until
 3 the opening of the Isaiah Hart Bridge.

4 What you're seeing here is his grave, or
 5 his actual standing mausoleum. And that was
 6 destroyed in the fire. It actually got
 7 vandalized and then destroyed in the fire, and
 8 the graves were relocated to Evergreen
 9 Cemetery. That's what you see in that picture.

10 The continued presence and use of Hemming
 11 Park over the last hundred years -- and this is
 12 the 150th anniversary of Hemming Park as
 13 Jacksonville's flagship park -- is attributed
 14 to the vision of Isaiah Hart.

15 Identified as the work of a master
 16 builder, designer or architect. We do not find
 17 that that criteria -- that the park met that
 18 criteria.

19 Its value as a building recognized for
 20 quality of its architecture. Again, we think
 21 that that, also, is a criteria that related to
 22 Hemming Park.

23 Number L, distinguishing characteristics
 24 of an architectural style valuable for the
 25 study of a period, method of construction or

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 use of indigenous materials.
 2 And this is -- the Confederate monument,
 3 if you want to call it the style, reflects a
 4 period during the late 19th and early 20th
 5 Century when memorials were being created and
 6 erected in towns and cities all throughout the
 7 south and the north.
 8 By this time, by 1898, or this period at
 9 the end of the 19th Century, many of these --
 10 many of the veterans were dying. The actual
 11 firsthand memories of the war were being
 12 erased, and so this effort was occurring, like
 13 I say, in both the south and the north.
 14 In the south, the placement of markers and
 15 monuments generally were initiated by women,
 16 women's organizations, such as the United
 17 Daughters of the Confederacy and the Ladies
 18 Memorial Association. In Jacksonville, of
 19 course, it was the result of a donation of a
 20 gentleman, Charles Hemming.
 21 The most common type of monument used was
 22 the "silent sentinel" as found in Hemming Park,
 23 as you can see there. It's usually a single
 24 soldier, at rest, at parade rest, with his
 25 hands holding the end of a musket barrel.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 of varying widths that converged in the center
 2 of the park. And they were on -- there was
 3 also some crosswalks, one going south and one
 4 going east-west as well.
 5 And in the center of the park was always
 6 some -- there was always either a fountain, a
 7 bandstand, and then of course later the
 8 Confederate monument. Over the years, added
 9 and removed were things like comfort stations,
 10 bandstands, and visitor centers.
 11 The only consistency during the historic
 12 period are the size, the use of the parcel as a
 13 public space, as well as the Confederate
 14 monument. Therefore, the suitability for
 15 preservation or restoration would relate only
 16 to those factors.
 17 I'll be happy to answer any questions.
 18 THE CHAIRMAN: Any questions for staff?
 19 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Okay. Well, I
 20 have some questions for staff. We might get to
 21 those afterwards, but let me ask, so when you
 22 did the report, there was really -- your report
 23 is a single report dealing with the park as
 24 whole?
 25 If you were to separate it out, that
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 Now, this particular type of monument --
 2 it's estimated, this particular type of
 3 monument was used over -- in 30 states. About
 4 2,500 of these type of monuments were erected.
 5 About a thousand are found in the south. I
 6 don't know how many in Florida. I do know that
 7 there's a monument to the Union Army in one
 8 city in Florida which is very much like this
 9 one.
 10 And all of these monuments were made in
 11 the north, in Connecticut, Massachusetts, and
 12 Ohio, using Italian marble or new England
 13 granite.
 14 The monument was made and erected by a
 15 Chicago company owned by George H. Mitchell.
 16 He was from Massachusetts, but he moved his
 17 company to the Chicago area.
 18 Suitability for preservation or
 19 restoration. Hemming Park has had several
 20 modifications, physical modifications, in the
 21 last hundred and sixty years as the city grew
 22 and changed.
 23 During most of its life, up until the time
 24 it was made into a plaza, the park has been
 25 characterized by straight and serpentine walks
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 Item F would only apply to the monument; is
 2 that correct?
 3 MR. McEACHIN: That is correct, although
 4 Item G could also relate to the monument as
 5 well, which is suitability for preservation and
 6 restoration, because that relates to the
 7 condition and the existence as a landmark.
 8 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Everything
 9 (inaudible) then?
 10 MR. McEACHIN: What's that?
 11 AUDIENCE MEMBER: We cannot hear.
 12 AUDIENCE MEMBER: We didn't hear the
 13 question.
 14 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Static.
 15 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: I'll repeat my
 16 question. My question -- we were clarifying an
 17 item in the report.
 18 AUDIENCE MEMBER: We still can't hear you.
 19 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: You can't hear?
 20 (Brief pause.)
 21 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: I mean, I can
 22 certainly turn that one off. Can you hear me
 23 now?
 24 AUDIENCE MEMBER: No. Turn the mic up to
 25 your mouth.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 MS. MARTINAGE: The mics are turned way
 2 down because they're addressing a problem right
 3 now. The mics are useless for the moment.
 4 AUDIENCE MEMBER: We can hear other
 5 people. We just could not hear her.
 6 MS. FETNER: Can you project, Angela?
 7 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Huh?
 8 MS. FETNER: Can you project?
 9 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: I can. I can
 10 just speak loud to the audience.
 11 Is that better? Okay.
 12 My question was about Item F in the
 13 landmark report, whether it applied to the park
 14 as a whole or to the monument only.
 15 Joel replied that it essentially applied
 16 to the monument. It's suitable for -- it
 17 doesn't need restoration at this point; is that
 18 right? But it is --
 19 MR. McEACHIN: I address the park and the
 20 monument as a whole.
 21 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: As a whole.
 22 MR. McEACHIN: However, I do want to make
 23 it clear, the criteria unrelated to the
 24 monument.
 25 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Right.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 There's some -- some amenities there, a tennis
 2 court, I believe, but the reason it was
 3 designated was because, number one, it was the
 4 second recreational area open for
 5 African-Americans in Jacksonville; and number
 6 two, it was directly associated with a pioneer
 7 recreational leader, Florida Dwight. And based
 8 upon that, it's been -- it's been designated as
 9 a landmark site.
 10 The other close things that we have to
 11 this would be more cemeteries as well. There
 12 have been quite a few cemeteries.
 13 THE CHAIRMAN: What about Memorial Park,
 14 was that ever designated?
 15 MR. McEACHIN: Memorial Park is within the
 16 boundaries of the Riverside Avondale Historic
 17 District, so it's under the same process.
 18 Because these parks, though, are under the
 19 district designation, it's not uncommon. Y'all
 20 have seen COAs for these parks come forward.
 21 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Let me ask you
 22 another question. As part of this new
 23 identification of the downtown historic
 24 district, would this park be reviewed under
 25 COAs as part of that designation?
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 MR. McEACHIN: And if you were looking at
 2 the monument, you probably (inaudible) with G,
 3 for suitability for preservation or
 4 restoration.
 5 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Then my comment
 6 is, the marker for New Kings Road, F and G
 7 would also be applicable to that as well?
 8 MR. McEACHIN: That's correct. That was
 9 stated in the report, too. Those two items,
 10 the marker -- the Confederate marker and the
 11 coquina marker is the only two items on the
 12 park from the historic period.
 13 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Can you
 14 speak -- and now, tell me if you can't, and I
 15 will speak up even louder.
 16 Can you speak to the precedent for parks
 17 only? Especially given other historic parks in
 18 the community -- Riverside, Avondale,
 19 Springfield -- do we have any precedent for
 20 having a park designated as a landmark?
 21 MR. McEACHIN: We do.
 22 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: We do. Okay.
 23 MR. McEACHIN: LaVilla Park was designated
 24 pretty early in the 1990s. LaVilla park is
 25 very -- it's mostly a large, grassy field.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 MR. McEACHIN: It would not because of
 2 what it is. The federal designation does not
 3 require any kind of local review. It is a
 4 contributing property. It's within the
 5 boundaries of the district, but the review
 6 process is strictly what occurs under
 7 Chapter 307, under the landmark designation.
 8 THE CHAIRMAN: Any further questions?
 9 MS. FETNER: Through the Chair, I have a
 10 question.
 11 Just for clarification, in your condition
 12 1(a), modifications being made to permanently
 13 change the use of any portion of the site in
 14 any way inconsistent with the urban public
 15 space, can you just go on the record and
 16 explain what you mean by "urban public space"?
 17 MR. McEACHIN: An urban public space is
 18 geared towards accommodating more passive
 19 outdoor activities conducive to a restricted
 20 urban environment.
 21 Some examples would include performing
 22 arts, visual arts, celebrations, speeches,
 23 press conferences, board games and just resting
 24 and socializing, as well as certain amenities
 25 that might be there such as concession.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 MS. FETNER: Okay.

2 THE CHAIRMAN: Any other questions for

3 staff?

4 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: I've got a

5 question. So the park itself got four,

6 correct?

7 MR. McEACHIN: That's our -- that's our

8 recommendation. That's our --

9 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: And that includes

10 Item Number C, correct? It's identified with a

11 person or persons who significantly contributed

12 to the development --

13 MR. McEACHIN: Yes.

14 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: And that is because

15 of Isaiah David Hart?

16 MR. McEACHIN: That's correct.

17 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: And because he

18 developed a grid that this park is in, that

19 was -- that was -- that was how --

20 MR. McEACHIN: He set that particular

21 piece of property for that purpose, as a public

22 park. And that was done in 1859, if not

23 earlier.

24 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Okay. Thank you.

25 MR. McEACHIN: There's not many physical
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 don't always make that association with -- with

2 him being the one that made sure that it was

3 created.

4 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: And remind us

5 one more time, what is the criteria with owner

6 support and without? What's the number of

7 items that --

8 MR. McEACHIN: If the owner objects in

9 writing, which the City of Jacksonville has, it

10 has to meet at least four standards, or you

11 have to determine that it meets four.

12 THE CHAIRMAN: Before we open it up to a

13 public hearing, those that wish to speak will

14 be allowed three minutes. Commissioner Allmand

15 will time.

16 MS. FETNER: There's two things.

17 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.

18 MS. FETNER: One is a matter of

19 housekeeping, and the other is a matter of just

20 for clarification from Joel.

21 If -- how many conditions or criteria does

22 the monument and the statue meet? Is it two,

23 or is it --

24 MR. McEACHIN: It could --

25 MS. FETNER: -- six?
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 representations in the city of Jacksonville of

2 Isaiah D. Hart. His plantation is, of course,

3 gone. He has no residence. The only thing

4 that we have of a physical nature is this -- is

5 the -- is the park or, of course, his grave.

6 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: I'm just -- I guess

7 I'm struggling a little bit to find -- I mean,

8 I understand, he set out the grid and set that

9 land aside, but I'm trying to figure out

10 whether or not that kind of makes it -- makes

11 the park identify with him in particular. I

12 don't -- so I'm not saying it doesn't or

13 doesn't. I'm just trying to figure out how

14 that works.

15 MR. McEACHIN: I do understand, because it

16 doesn't carry his name or anything.

17 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: It doesn't carry

18 his name, and it never was --

19 AUDIENCE MEMBER: We cannot hear.

20 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Can't hear a word.

21 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: -- never was

22 connected like, or you know, in this particular

23 place, outside of just setting it aside.

24 MR. McEACHIN: Yes, that's correct. But

25 you say it never carried his name. So people
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 MR. McEACHIN: If I specifically addressed

2 it by itself --

3 MS. FETNER: Uh-huh.

4 MR. McEACHIN: -- it would meet at least

5 two, one being F and one being Number G,

6 suitability for preservation or restoration.

7 It might be looked at for A as well, but it

8 definitely would meet at least two standards.

9 MS. FETNER: At least two, maybe three is

10 what you're saying?

11 MR. McEACHIN: Possibly. Yes.

12 MS. FETNER: Okay. Thank you.

13 And then for housekeeping matters, the --

14 in order to stop the static, they will need to

15 shut off every mic and try to figure out which

16 mic is making the static.

17 It sounds okay right now. I don't know if

18 everyone can hear me. I talk loud already, so

19 that might be it, but that might take ten

20 minutes or more.

21 So it's up to the chairman, if you would

22 like to have them correct the problem now,

23 before public comment begins, or if you would

24 like to go forward and just see if we can work

25 through this issue?
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300



1 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Could they hear
 2 the podium mic? Because they'll be able to
 3 hear --
 4 MS. FETNER: The podium mic? There's no
 5 podium mic.
 6 THE CHAIRMAN: Let's test the podium mic
 7 first and then we'll decide after that.
 8 (Brief pause.)
 9 THE CHAIRMAN: Why don't we -- because
 10 there's a lot of interested folks in the
 11 audience, why don't we take a ten-minute break
 12 and see if we can't get these -- get these
 13 things fixed.
 14 Are y'all in agreement with that?
 15 MR. McEACHIN: Yes.
 16 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.
 17 AUDIENCE MEMBER: If you need about ten
 18 minutes, I can make sure we have amplification
 19 for the room. I can run down and grab some for
 20 the remainder of the meeting.
 21 THE CHAIRMAN: We have a tech on the way
 22 that's coming to fix it. So ...
 23 (Brief pause.)
 24 THE CHAIRMAN: We're going to take an
 25 official ten-minute recess, and hopefully we
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?
 2 MR. WOOD: Absolutely.
 3 MS. BLAKE: Thank you.
 4 MR. WOOD: So as you know, Friends of
 5 Hemming Park is a nonprofit organization that
 6 is working very hard to try to restore what's
 7 long been called Hemming Plaza and make it,
 8 once more, a vibrant part of our downtown.
 9 This has been a daunting task. And we're
 10 facing hundreds of challenges, but we're doing
 11 it. And the whole idea of declaring the entire
 12 park a landmark is -- is wrong for a number of
 13 reasons.
 14 One, there is no historic fabric left in
 15 the park from its historic era other than the
 16 Confederate monument and the Kings Road
 17 monument, which are there. So this, I think,
 18 sets a bad precedent. It says, if this passes,
 19 we would have to get a COA for certain uses.
 20 And it doesn't spell it out clearly.
 21 It says if we change the use of any
 22 portion of the site in any way consistent with
 23 an urban public space -- how do you define
 24 "urban public space?" A sidewalk is an urban
 25 public space. A street is an urban public
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 can get this resolved.
 2 THE REPORTER: They can't hear you.
 3 THE CHAIRMAN: We're taking a ten-minute
 4 recess. Hopefully, we can get it resolved.
 5 MS. BLAKE: Ladies and gentlemen, we will
 6 be taking a ten-minute recess to give the techs
 7 a chance to get this issue resolved.
 8 Thank you for your patience.
 9 (Brief recess.)
 10 THE CHAIRMAN: It appears, we're back in
 11 business, and we're going to reconvene.
 12 And a reminder for our speakers, we have a
 13 three-minute timer.
 14 I'm opening the public hearing. And the
 15 first -- the first speakers will be Friends of
 16 Hemming Plaza.
 17 (Audience member approaches the podium.)
 18 AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm Wayne Wood. I live
 19 at 2821 Riverside Avenue, and I am representing
 20 the Friends of Hemming Park.
 21 MS. BLAKE: Would you raise your right
 22 hand, please.
 23 MR. WOOD: (Complies.)
 24 MS. BLAKE: Do you affirm that the
 25 testimony you are about to give is the truth,
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 space. The definition is so lax that it has
 2 actually no meaning to it. And any other work
 3 which the Department determines to be in
 4 conflict would cause us to have to do a COA.
 5 Our work is so difficult already, to have
 6 to get a COA for every positive change we make
 7 in the park, if we bring in a work of
 8 sculpture, like we did a few months ago, we
 9 would have to get a COA for everything we do.
 10 And it is ludicrous to make us have to
 11 jump through hoops when this park -- you saw
 12 these beautiful pictures of a historic park.
 13 It's gone through five or six different
 14 iterations.
 15 In 1978, they changed it from being
 16 Hemming Park to a plaza. And it ceased being a
 17 historic park at that point. The monument
 18 remains there.
 19 We have no objection to designating the
 20 Confederate monument as a landmark, as it
 21 should be. It's been there for a long time,
 22 and we go for that, but the park you see today
 23 is a hardscape of brick. The grass is gone.
 24 All the iterations of the park you have seen in
 25 the historic past are gone.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 The Secretary of Interior's criteria for
2 being on the National Register is something
3 that's 50 years old. And so 95 percent of the
4 park is not 50 years old in its historic
5 element.

6 Joel did a great job writing the history
7 of the park, but he got one thing wrong. And
8 that is, it does not qualify for Section G.
9 It's got A, B, and C. We don't have any
10 objection to that, but to make that fourth
11 criteria, is it suitable for preservation or
12 restoration, what is there to preserve other
13 than the statue? I mean, you can't preserve
14 the bricks. The bricks are not historic.
15 They're not 50 years old.

16 Does it warrant restoration? What would
17 you restore it to? Which one of those pictures
18 you saw would you restore it to, and how
19 practical is that in modern times?

20 The only consistency is, during historic
21 periods, admitted in his write-up, is that the
22 size of the park -- nobody has made any effort
23 to want to change the size. And the use of the
24 park -- the use of the park has evolved much
25 since it was laid out by Isaiah D. Hart. It

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 property. It doesn't actually provide any
2 protections. It provides eligibility for
3 grants in order to restore, if you want to keep
4 the historic nature of the item, but it doesn't
5 actually provide any protection.

6 Protection is provided through a local
7 either landmark status or historic district
8 status. Downtown doesn't have historic
9 district status. And that is why Joel's answer
10 was that it doesn't protect the park. It's not
11 that it was left out. It's within it. And as
12 he said, it's a contributing part of the
13 National Register Historic District for
14 downtown.

15 MR. WOOD: I stand corrected. I'm sorry.
16 I'm glad you got to explain that for the
17 audience as well as me.

18 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Yeah. Let me ask
19 you this: How would you change the wording
20 then? Because I assume that -- because Friends
21 of Hemming Park would be opposed to the park
22 being subdivided, sold and built upon and
23 eliminated as a park, correct?

24 MR. WOOD: Absolutely.

25 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Okay. So
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 was a passive park originally. It became an
2 active park where speeches are made and so
3 forth.

4 So we have no objections to the
5 Confederate monument being designated, but to
6 designate the entire park as a historic
7 landmark, why --

8 (Timer audibly indicating speaker's
9 three-minute time limit has expired.)

10 MR. WOOD: -- wasn't this recognized when
11 y'all did the National Register nomination for
12 all downtown? This was left out because --

13 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: It wasn't left
14 out.

15 MR. WOOD: -- it's not -- it's not listed
16 individually, or you wouldn't have to be
17 passing this as a separate landmark today.

18 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: No. Actually,
19 the designation downtown is not as a local
20 landmark or historic district. The designation
21 for downtown is on the National Register.
22 Those are two completely different concepts.

23 And I'll say it out loud for the rest of
24 the audience as well, the National Register
25 District merely lists it as a designated

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 designating the park would protect its use as a
2 park. So if you don't like the language that's
3 proposed, how would you suggest that being
4 changed?

5 MR. WOOD: I would suggest that the park
6 itself not be designated as a historic
7 landmark, which it is not.

8 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: But if it's not
9 designated as so, then you're desire for it to
10 remain wouldn't be protected. The City,
11 tomorrow, could sell it to a developer or it
12 could get designated to JTA to put a bus
13 transfer station there or whatever. Tomorrow,
14 its use could change so that it was no longer a
15 park because it doesn't have any protections.

16 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Well, it is
17 protected by other design review boards that
18 govern downtown.

19 MR. WOOD: Yeah.

20 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: And I think
21 they would consider the value of an open space
22 at the center of downtown very critical.

23 MR. WOOD: And we recently did that. We
24 went before the Design Review Board to talk
25 about doing a kiosk in the park, and it was

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300



1 approved.

2 I'm over time. If I could just make two

3 last points. One, this is a site, a lot of

4 historic stuff has happened there, but the

5 fabric of it is gone.

6 You could easily designate the empty lot

7 on the corner of Laura and Adams Street, which

8 was the site of the first city library, as a

9 historic landmark, but you're not going to do

10 that.

11 You could easily designate the empty

12 parking lot where Isaiah D. Hart's house was as

13 a historic landmark, but you're not going to do

14 that. That was on the corner of Forsyth and

15 Laura. You could find historic places all

16 over, but you're not going to designate them as

17 a landmark because they don't have the original

18 fabric.

19 To show you how ludicrous this is, we

20 recently were sued by a member of the

21 opposition to what we're doing because we moved

22 bricks. We picked them up, to look and see

23 what was under them, and we were sued.

24 You're just inviting continual lawsuits

25 and stumbling blocks for us to do our work to

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

2 AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (Respond

3 affirmatively.)

4 MS. BLAKE: Thank you.

5 So when you come up, all you need to do is

6 state your name and address.

7 Thank you very much.

8 (Audience member approaches the podium.)

9 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Hello.

10 My name is Seber Newsome, III. I live at

11 86110 Fieldstone Drive, Yulee, Florida. I was

12 born and raised in Jacksonville. I lived here

13 for 50 years.

14 Mr. McEachin gave a fantastic presentation

15 about Hemming Park and the statue. While it

16 would be great if Hemming Park became a city

17 landmark, realistically, that's not going to

18 happen.

19 The City opposes that because of their

20 ties with the group, The Friends of Hemming

21 Park. They have much money already invested in

22 this group. So the best chance is to get the

23 statue of the Confederate soldier nominated as

24 a city landmark since they are not opposed to

25 that.

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 restore and preserve Hemming Park. And to use

2 the historic preservation ordinance as a way of

3 making things more difficult in something

4 that's already difficult is -- would be

5 disappointing.

6 And I hope you will see the wisdom that

7 this does not meet Criteria Number G, I believe

8 it is. So there are only three of the criteria

9 met.

10 Thank you very much.

11 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

12 MS. BLAKE: Mr. Chairman, if it's all

13 right with you, can we ask everyone to stand,

14 and we can swear everyone that's speaking to

15 this particular item?

16 THE CHAIRMAN: That would be a great idea.

17 MS. BLAKÉ: Thank you very much.

18 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

19 MS. BLAKE: Members of the audience, if

20 anyone who is here to speak on this particular

21 item, Hemming Plaza/Park, would you please

22 stand and raise your right hand.

23 AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (Comply.)

24 MS. BLAKE: Do you affirm that the

25 testimony you are about to give is the truth,

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 There are over 150 designated city

2 landmarks in Jacksonville. The statue of the

3 Confederate soldier is as important to

4 Jacksonville as any of those. The importance

5 of monuments relates to the commemoration of

6 significant events of the Civil War and the

7 soldiers and sailors who took part, which, at

8 some level, was the reason behind these

9 monuments.

10 They were also a means to memorialize

11 soldiers dead and buried on distant

12 battlefields and campsites. By the time the

13 War was over, about one-third of Florida

14 soldiers had died. About 5,000. Initially,

15 the monument builders have lived through the

16 horrible conflict and knew directly of the

17 human cost.

18 As time went on, they were joined by

19 generations who did not experience the war

20 firsthand, but rather by stories told of those

21 who had. They understood the importance of the

22 local monuments in a manner that we simply are

23 incapable of today. They are gone, but the

24 monuments remain. It was their hope that their

25 message, which they can no longer convey

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300



1 themselves, live on through this monument.
 2 Civil War memory preserved in bronze and
 3 stone monuments are important sculpture that
 4 adorn our 21st Century landscape. Constructed
 5 with a lesson in mind, these monuments can
 6 themselves be lessons in understanding a very
 7 important social process in modern U.S.
 8 history, the process remembering the Civil War
 9 and its relationship to our contemporary lives.
 10 They were put up in public squares and in front
 11 of courthouses so people could see and remember
 12 the sacrifices made.

13 The monument erected in Jacksonville in
 14 1898 through the Hemmings generosity is,
 15 perhaps, the most handsome of all the monuments
 16 erected in the state. Today, it stands as a
 17 rare survivor of the 1901 fire and a
 18 centerpiece of a rebuilt city. Let's protect
 19 it for future generations to learn from. This
 20 is our history. Let's not become another
 21 New Orleans or other cities in the south who
 22 have had their history removed.

23 Some of what I said came from this book
 24 here, Recalling Deeds Immortal. It has six
 25 pages in it dedicated to the statue in Hemming
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 history has been covered well, which is what I
 2 was going to talk about. And I just think
 3 Jacksonville has sprung up, as we all know,
 4 after the fire of 1901. And we -- we look like
 5 a city that really doesn't have any history.

6 And that monument, the statue was not a
 7 generic statue. A real veteran was selected to
 8 be the model for that statue. And I just
 9 think -- just look at what ISIS has done in the
 10 Middle East, tearing down landmarks and ancient
 11 antiquities.

12 And I just think Jacksonville needs to be
 13 proud of who and what we are. And I just hope
 14 that that statue can be designated as a
 15 landmark.

16 Thank you.

17 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

18 MS. BLAKE: Bob Wise.

19 (Audience member approaches the podium.)

20 AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Bob Wise,
 21 2757 Arapahoe Avenue, Jacksonville, Florida
 22 32210.

23 The Confederate soldier statue, which
 24 dates back to 1898, needs to be protected to
 25 the fullest. This large, ornate, historical

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 Park. That's how important it is. And I
 2 originally wanted Hemming Park itself to be a
 3 landmark, but realistically, the City
 4 Council --

5 (Timer audibly indicating speaker's
 6 three-minute time limit has expired.)

7 MR. WOOD: -- won't vote on that
 8 improvement, I'm sure. So we're here as a
 9 group. We want the statue to be nominated as a
 10 city landmark. That is our goal.

11 Thank you very much.

12 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

13 MS. BLAKE: Bob Wise.

14 MR. NEWSOME: Can Mrs. Kennelly speak?

15 MS. BLAKE: Absolutely. What is her name,
 16 sir?

17 MR. NEWSOME: Mrs. Kennelly.

18 MS. BLAKE: Okay.

19 (Audience member approaches the podium.)

20 THE CHAIRMAN: Subsequent speakers, if
 21 you're going to say the same thing that's
 22 already been said, pass the baton to someone
 23 else who has some additional comments to make
 24 that are not duplicates, please.

25 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Well, I think the
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 monument in Hemming Park is in danger and
 2 threatened to be demolished. The statue
 3 represents and reflects a different time in the
 4 history of our park.

5 The 62-foot-tall monument has an
 6 8-and-a-half-foot-tall bronze Confederate
 7 soldier, on ornate cornice, supported by a
 8 17-and-a-half-foot-tall round column made of a
 9 solid piece of granite with an ornate pedestal
 10 and base.

11 This was quite a remarkable project back
 12 in the late 1880s when there were none of the
 13 modern construction methods as we have today.

14 All the work was done by hand. Just the
 15 details I've mentioned are a cause to protect
 16 this monument as a designated landmark.

17 Thank you.

18 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

19 MS. BLAKE: Madeline Scales-Taylor.

20 (Audience member approaches the podium.)

21 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon.

22 My name is Madeline Scales-Taylor. I live
 23 at 1401 Riverplace Boulevard, Unit 1611,
 24 Jacksonville, Florida.

25 I speak on behalf of the Women of Delta

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 Sigma Theta Sorority, Incorporated, the
 2 Jacksonville Chapter representing over 300
 3 African-American women.
 4 I am glad to hear that we are separating
 5 those two issues, Hemming Park and the
 6 monument. We recognize that Hemming Park has a
 7 very, very rich history. And part of that
 8 history has to do with the movement of equality
 9 for all people in this community.
 10 We recognize that the monument is also a
 11 part of the history of Jacksonville, but we
 12 also have concern with that monument in a
 13 prominent place being designated as a landmark
 14 in this city. It speaks to who we are as a
 15 city and what we are as a city, and I'm not
 16 sure that that's what we want to speak to as a
 17 city that is going forward.
 18 We know that this is a part of our
 19 history. And we think that the monument
 20 certainly can be saved, but it does not need to
 21 be in the thoroughfare and the entrance of our
 22 city at this time.
 23 History, you know, gives us the good and
 24 it gives us the bad. We think something like
 25 the monument of a Confederate soldier only
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 It doesn't change history. It doesn't
 2 change anything. Being proud of what your
 3 history is and learning from it is what we
 4 should be doing. That statue right there has
 5 been there through a lot of different things
 6 that have gone wrong with Jacksonville.
 7 Just like the history, the fire, the civil
 8 rights movement, it certainly was a horrible
 9 time in our history, but the Civil War is a
 10 horrible time in our history. Reclamation was
 11 a horrible time in the south. And the South
 12 was punished badly for the Civil War, just like
 13 a lot of other states were and cities were.
 14 Taking down the statue is not going to
 15 make a damn bit of difference in anything that
 16 goes on in the city.
 17 Thank you.
 18 MS. BLAKE: Payne -- is that Fewell?
 19 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Fewell. Yes, ma'am.
 20 MS. BLAKE: Okay.
 21 (Audience member approaches the podium.)
 22 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Payne Fewell, 3623 Boone
 23 Park Avenue, Jacksonville, Florida.
 24 I came here to speak on behalf the support
 25 of Hemming Plaza. I certainly would hope that
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 speaks to divide us, not bring us together. So
 2 we are very pleased and proud that the City has
 3 chosen to separate those two issues, but we
 4 would hope that if the monument stays, that it
 5 doesn't stay in its current location.
 6 Thank you.
 7 MS. BLAKE: Priscilla -- I'm not sure
 8 about the last name -- Whitcher?
 9 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yes.
 10 (Audience member approaches the podium.)
 11 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Priscilla Whitcher,
 12 3456 --
 13 MS. BLAKE: If you would speak right into
 14 that mic.
 15 MS. WHITCHER: Priscilla Whitcher, 3456
 16 Broadway Avenue, Jacksonville, Florida.
 17 I don't have a whole lot to add. I have
 18 to agree with Mr. Newsome on this, except for
 19 the fact that changing -- moving the statue,
 20 where are you going to move it? Are you going
 21 to move it out by the river? Are you going to
 22 take it to the dump? It will still be a
 23 statue. It will still be up there. You could
 24 say oh, well, that's our statue of our
 25 Confederate soldier.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 it could be a designated, protected site. As
 2 we are told by our gentleman here, it's got a
 3 lot of history to it, good or bad.
 4 It was donated by the Hart Family. And
 5 believe it or not, the Hart Family still lives
 6 here in Jacksonville, because I am one of them.
 7 And there's many of us here. I think it would
 8 be -- I think even recently, there was a
 9 monument put up designating the park and its
 10 history as it was donated by Hart, by the
 11 family.
 12 I would certainly hope that you can
 13 protect the park. If not, you should protect
 14 all structures within the park, all monuments,
 15 all markers, all signs, all areas which people
 16 can use it.
 17 Yourself, as the Jacksonville Historic
 18 Preservation Commission, certainly, you should
 19 preserve history every chance you get. Well,
 20 here it sits. And you have the opportunity now
 21 to protect history.
 22 This monument is not only what we are and
 23 who we are, but this is -- these are American
 24 veterans. These were -- the Confederate
 25 soldiers were designated by Congress as
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 American military veterans. Many of them were
 2 born and raised here in Jacksonville. Many of
 3 them died in the surrounding areas. And many
 4 of them went to other states to fight the
 5 battles.
 6 There are some dark spots in our history,
 7 sure, but taking down this monument or taking
 8 down any monument is not going to change it.
 9 We just have to learn from it.
 10 Thank you.
 11 MS. BLAKE: Dr. Barbara Darby.
 12 (Audience member approaches the podium.)
 13 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon. Good
 14 afternoon.
 15 AUDIENCE MEMBERS: Good afternoon.
 16 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Thank you.
 17 I'm Barbara Darby. I reside at 2725 Percy
 18 Road, Jacksonville, Florida 32218. I am also a
 19 member of Delta Sigma Theta Sorority.
 20 And I rise for some clarification from the
 21 Commission. I do have three questions that
 22 will help me as this process continues.
 23 One is, is it possible to know -- because
 24 I have not been able to determine -- who is the
 25 sponsor of the application for the landmark?
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 favor of recommending the park or the monument,
 2 however they choose to phrase it, as a landmark
 3 designation.
 4 Once that happens, we submit a bill to the
 5 Council, which then goes through the normal
 6 cycle, Council cycle. So it will go before the
 7 LUZ, the Land Use and Zoning Committee. And
 8 then once it goes through there, then it goes
 9 to the Council, and it's voted. The Land Use
 10 and Zoning Committee would give a
 11 recommendation.
 12 So there's at least three public hearings
 13 at Council before the final decision is made.
 14 So once that decision -- once that vote
 15 happens, at Council, if they vote in favor of
 16 landmarking it, then it becomes a landmark. So
 17 this is just for a recommendation from the
 18 Commission, which is the typical route of most
 19 landmark designations.
 20 Is there anything anyone would like to
 21 add?
 22 THE CHAIRMAN: Did that answer all your
 23 questions?
 24 MS. DARBY: Yes.
 25 Let me pose one more. There's been some
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 THE CHAIRMAN: We are.
 2 MS. DARBY: Okay. So the Commission is.
 3 Okay. Great.
 4 Secondly, I wanted to know if you could
 5 share what the pathway from today's
 6 presentation to actual designation is.
 7 And how does the owner's opposition to the
 8 designation that has been requested play into
 9 this pathway and this process?
 10 And then, finally, is there a way to
 11 provide for more diverse input into this
 12 discussion that is taking place about what will
 13 happen with the landmark designation?
 14 So I did ask --
 15 THE CHAIRMAN: I will try to answer those
 16 questions for you.
 17 MS. FETNER: Do you want me to do it?
 18 THE CHAIRMAN: You can if you would like.
 19 MS. FETNER: Okay. Through the Chair,
 20 basically, what's going on here is a
 21 recommendation, a vote on a recommendation from
 22 the Commission.
 23 And since the owner is in opposition, the
 24 Commission would need to have a majority plus
 25 one vote, which would be five members voting in
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 discussion about separating the two, the plaza
 2 itself and the monument itself. What would
 3 need to happen for that two-prong process to go
 4 forward?
 5 MS. FETNER: That would be based on motion
 6 by the Commission.
 7 (Timer audibly indicating speaker's
 8 three-minute time limit has expired.)
 9 MS. FETNER: So if the Commission desires
 10 to separate the two, they can do it that way.
 11 They -- so however they send it -- so if they
 12 decide to separate it, there might be a -- if
 13 they decide to just go with the -- the
 14 monument, there may be an interest to also look
 15 at the park and then allow the Council to
 16 decide.
 17 So we could -- really, however the
 18 Commission desires, I can make the bill that
 19 way.
 20 MS. DARBY: Okay. Thank you.
 21 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
 22 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: While we're
 23 waiting on the next speaker, I wanted to just
 24 see if staff could clarify this.
 25 One of the community members mentioned the
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 term "demolition." And I wanted to clarify
 2 that there's been no application or no
 3 initiative to demolish this monument to
 4 anyone's knowledge, to staff's knowledge.
 5 MR. McEACHIN: That's correct.
 6 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Or move it?
 7 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Or move it.
 8 MR. McEACHIN: That's correct.
 9 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Or do anything?
 10 THE CHAIRMAN: Correct.
 11 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Got it.
 12 MS. BLAKE: John Aloszka. Forgive me if I
 13 said it wrong.
 14 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Everyone does.
 15 MS. BLAKE: Okay.
 16 (Audience member approaches the podium.)
 17 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Hello.
 18 Thank you to the Commission for holding
 19 this forum.
 20 Hemming Park is Jacksonville's most
 21 famous --
 22 MS. BLAKE: Excuse me, John. Would you
 23 state -- would you state your name and address?
 24 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Oh.
 25 John Aloszka, 8021 Joshua Tree Lane,
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 installed until later in American history. I
 2 pose this to the Commission: Which park shall
 3 we make historic? St. James Park is the
 4 original Hemming Park, and in my opinion,
 5 should be reinstated as the public park we use
 6 today.
 7 Hemming Park -- the only thing historic
 8 about Hemming Park is the plot of land. Its
 9 aesthetics alone are not historic. The
 10 renovations of Hemming Park in the 20th Century
 11 were not in keeping with its historic roots and
 12 are not worthy of landmark status.
 13 The geometric brick, tiled fountains and
 14 planters are not how Hemming Park was
 15 originally designed. This also includes the
 16 monument. St. James Park contained (inaudible)
 17 of land, (inaudible) fill, and fountains in
 18 totally different areas.
 19 The National Registry of Historic Places,
 20 which can often and is used as a parallel for
 21 this Commission says, quote, Does the place
 22 still look the way it did in the past, end
 23 quote. I think we can all agree, and the slide
 24 show can show that it does not look how it did
 25 in the past.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 Jacksonville, 32256.
 2 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: And let me just
 3 caution you and the others, when people read,
 4 they do it really fast, to try to get through
 5 stuff --
 6 MR. ALOSZKA: Uh-huh.
 7 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: -- but she has to
 8 take down everything you say.
 9 MR. ALOSZKA: Okay.
 10 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: So do it nice and
 11 slow.
 12 MR. ALOSZKA: Hemming Park is
 13 Jacksonville's most famous park, one where
 14 people gather, presidents and leaders speak and
 15 where protestors have broadly continued to
 16 bring the community forward. However, these
 17 qualities alone do not warrant historic status
 18 for Hemming Park. And I am here today to lay
 19 out why.
 20 First, we must recognize Hemming Park's
 21 history. Originally penned as City Park, and
 22 then St. James Park, Hemming Park did not
 23 contain a Confederate monument until 1898.
 24 As with most Confederate monuments and
 25 flag placements in America, they weren't
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 And a lot of people over here have said
 2 Isaiah D. Hart is, alone, a reason to make this
 3 park historic, but it doesn't look at all like
 4 how Isaiah D. Hart originally saw it. I mean,
 5 he even died before the monument was made. So
 6 I think besides laying the grid, there is
 7 really no warrant for Isaiah D. Hart to even be
 8 considered in the making of this place
 9 historic.
 10 And if Hemming Park is to obtain landmark
 11 status, the later renovations in the 20th
 12 Century must be removed and reverted back to
 13 its original form, in my opinion.
 14 And I would personally suggest that the
 15 monument alone be moved to Confederate Park in
 16 Springfield. I feel like that would be a good
 17 compromise, as people really don't like to look
 18 at it. I don't like it, these people don't
 19 like it, but I think if we had all the
 20 Confederate monuments in one place, Confederate
 21 Park, it would be a good compromise for
 22 everyone.
 23 I hope we can all agree that Hemming Park
 24 is not fit for landmark status. It is unlike
 25 other historic parks and other historic
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 landmarks that have come before this Council.
 2 Like, the Drew Building, Eleanor Flats, they
 3 are all historic, at least in their facade,
 4 while Hemming Park is not.
 5 (Timer audibly indicating speaker's
 6 three-minute time limit has expired.)
 7 MR. ALOSZKA: Thank you.
 8 MS. BLAKE: Marshall Rowsen (pronouncing)
 9 or Rowsen?
 10 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Rowsen. Yes, ma'am.
 11 MS. BLAKE: Thank you.
 12 (Audience member approaches the podium.)
 13 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Marshall Clayton Rowsen,
 14 1251 Beacon Point Drive, Jacksonville, Florida.
 15 I don't have anything prepared for today,
 16 but I'm definitely passionate about the issue.
 17 My family has been here for over a hundred
 18 years. My grandpa grew up just down the street
 19 from here. And not only is this an
 20 aesthetically pleasing monument, but, you know,
 21 it serves something greater than that.
 22 It -- this is a monument dedicated to a
 23 citizen soldier who stood against an invasion
 24 of his home. And I think we should see more
 25 monuments, you know, like this instead of less.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 2081 Chaffee Road, Jacksonville, Florida 32221.
 2 I'm here representing three different
 3 people. I represent the Museum of Southern
 4 History, established in 1975, one of the oldest
 5 museums in Jacksonville. And they sent me here
 6 to tell you that they're in favor of making the
 7 Confederate statue a landmark.
 8 I am also representing the Sons of
 9 Confederate Veterans. Jacksonville happens to
 10 be the largest camp on the planet. We have
 11 camps all over the place -- Germany, Japan,
 12 France, all around the world -- and
 13 Jacksonville just happens to be the largest. I
 14 represent them, and they told me to come here
 15 and tell you guys to make the Confederate
 16 monument a landmark, too. They're a lot of
 17 voters, too.
 18 I also represent myself. I'm James
 19 Shillinglaw. I live here, in Jacksonville, and
 20 I'm a Confederate reenactor, and I enjoy
 21 history of all the ages. I'm in favor of
 22 making the Confederate monument a landmark,
 23 too. It's been here for a long time. You guys
 24 have heard all of the history on it, so I'm not
 25 going to repeat that.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 I mean, what's more honorable than defending
 2 your home and your country?
 3 I would like to see this monument be
 4 preserved as a historic landmark. And if we
 5 want to build a monument in Confederate Park,
 6 that's cool, too, but let's keep this one here.
 7 Thank you.
 8 MS. BLAKE: Mary Ellen -- I'm not sure
 9 about the last name.
 10 AUDIENCE MEMBER: She's here, but she's
 11 not feeling too good.
 12 MS. BLAKE: Okay.
 13 AUDIENCE MEMBER: And she's in favor of.
 14 MS. BLAKE: Well, you can't speak for her,
 15 sir. We'll give everybody a chance to speak.
 16 Thank you.
 17 James Shillinglaw.
 18 AUDIENCE MEMBER: That's me. Can I talk
 19 now?
 20 MS. BLAKE: Okay. Come on down.
 21 AUDIENCE MEMBER: I had a feeling that was
 22 going to happen.
 23 MS. BLAKE: You're good.
 24 (Audience member approaches the podium.)
 25 AUDIENCE MEMBER: I'm James Shillinglaw,
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 I'm just really encouraged, making it a
 2 landmark, because that's what makes us as a
 3 people. It's a piece of culture. And the
 4 culture is the foundation of our society. And
 5 it makes us who we are. If makes us -- even if
 6 you don't like the monument, it melds us as a
 7 character. You can tell your grandkids that
 8 you don't like it, I'll tell my grandkids I
 9 like it. So it's part of our society. So
 10 that's the reason why it should be preserved as
 11 a landmark.
 12 There are other monuments, too, I would
 13 like to see proposed. We don't have any
 14 problems with the park being -- if you want to
 15 make it a landmark, if you don't want to make
 16 it a landmark, we leave that decision up to
 17 y'all. You know, everybody in here has been
 18 very intelligent and courteous and friendly. I
 19 really appreciate it. And Joel, he's done a
 20 tremendous job.
 21 I jus want to say, from all three
 22 organizations -- me, myself, included -- that
 23 we appreciate everything that you've done so
 24 far.
 25 Thank you.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 MS. BLAKE: Ronald Parks.
 2 (Audience member approaches the podium.)
 3 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good evening, ladies and
 4 gentlemen.
 5 My name is Ronald Parks. I live at 3658
 6 Havenwood Road, Middleburg.
 7 MS. BLAKE: Ronald, would you pull that
 8 down just a little bit so --
 9 MR. PARKS: Did y'all get all of that, or
 10 do I have to do it again?
 11 THE CHAIRMAN: We're good.
 12 MR. PARKS: Thank you.
 13 THE CHAIRMAN: Go ahead. We're good.
 14 MR. PARKS: All right. I believe in the
 15 monument -- all monuments, historical, black,
 16 white, Chinese or whatever -- needs to stay.
 17 If it has a historical value in our country, we
 18 must honor our country and the memories, good
 19 or bad. We cannot erase the good or the bad.
 20 We must settle and live with it.
 21 I believe that we should keep this as a
 22 monument, a safe monument, a landmark, and not
 23 be destroyed or moved. If we move, that means
 24 we give up everything. If we play -- if you
 25 play chess, if you make one move on the board,
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 itself, at least becomes a landmark.
 2 Thank you.
 3 MS. BLAKE: Cyrus Quaranta.
 4 (Audience member approaches the podium.)
 5 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Before I begin, I would
 6 just ask if it's okay that I distribute some
 7 documents to the committee for their --
 8 MS. BLAKE: Sir, your time has started.
 9 If you keep speaking, I'll distribute those for
 10 you.
 11 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon, ladies
 12 and gentlemen, esteemed members of this
 13 committee.
 14 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Give us your name
 15 and address.
 16 AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Cyrus
 17 Quaranta. My address, 718 Perryman Lane West.
 18 I first want to just say that I am, in no
 19 way, advocating the removal of this monument or
 20 anything to be changed about it, but this
 21 monument does represent a very narrow view of
 22 southern history and an even more incomplete
 23 view of history overall.
 24 I love studying history. I support the
 25 preservation of southern history, like many
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 you move one piece, you move all the pieces.
 2 It's a change reaction. So let's don't make
 3 this a change reaction.
 4 Y'all have a nice day.
 5 Thank you.
 6 MS. BLAKE: Peyton Quina.
 7 (Audience member approaches the podium.)
 8 AUDIENCE MEMBER: My name is Peyton Quina.
 9 I live in -- is it all right? I live in
 10 Avondale. I've lived in Jacksonville 41 years.
 11 Okay.
 12 So if I had my way, the park would look
 13 like it did in 1907. It was beautiful. I
 14 don't -- I will not talk about what I think it
 15 looks like now because that's not germane to
 16 this conversation, but I definitely want it to
 17 be a landmark.
 18 I'm not talking about the park itself.
 19 That's fine. I would love to see that. It's
 20 not going to happen probably, but I am
 21 extremely disappointed that if the monument
 22 itself was not made a landmark a hundred years
 23 ago -- and I can't believe that it's still
 24 going on today.
 25 So please see to it that it, the monument
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 people in this room today, but there is much to
 2 be learned about the use of federal authority,
 3 the rights of the states and those left behind
 4 when we collectively outlaw the foundation for
 5 a way of life.
 6 As a student of history, I also understand
 7 that in most instances the history that is
 8 recorded is from the perspective of the victim.
 9 The other side of the story must be told and
 10 recounted so that we are able to learn from the
 11 wisdom gleaned by those experiences.
 12 However, whenever the story is
 13 memorialized and only includes a partial,
 14 incomplete and imbalanced record, we cheat
 15 future generations and ourselves out of the
 16 opportunity to truly learn from the lessons of
 17 one of the darkest moments in our nation's
 18 history.
 19 Memorializing this monument with a
 20 historical designation would be a collective
 21 agreement that this tells the whole story, but
 22 it doesn't. This prestigious and fair
 23 committee has been tasked with capturing these
 24 stories. You could choose to, for the first
 25 time ever, alter that story or recognize that
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 it is incomplete. And I trust that you all
 2 steward fairly over the record of our history
 3 and this decision as you always have.
 4 Thank you for your time.
 5 MS. BLAKE: Stephen Dare.
 6 (Audience member approaches the podium.)
 7 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Hello, everyone.
 8 Stephen Dare, 1719 North Main Street.
 9 Can you hear me? Yep.
 10 All right. So I really wanted to kind of
 11 address this issue for what it actually is. I
 12 mean, it's been masquerading as an attempt to
 13 landmark a park, but as you've seen from the
 14 testimony, it's really just a clever way of
 15 creating a proxy fight for you to decide
 16 whether or not Confederate monuments are
 17 appropriate in public squares. And I think
 18 that's a larger charge than the Commission is
 19 charged with.
 20 Obviously, there have been very compelling
 21 arguments as to why the park itself doesn't,
 22 you know, merit historic designation.
 23 And Joel, I love your history of Hemming
 24 Park, but you left out one of my favorite
 25 things, and that was the 1914 election of
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 from all of the people stealing the goods in
 2 the warehouses. It is not Jacksonville's
 3 history. It is Florida's history, but it is
 4 not necessarily ours.
 5 The park itself, when it was deeded to the
 6 City, contained an agreement that if it ever
 7 stopped being a park, the land would revert to
 8 the Hart heirs. So it's protected. That's
 9 part of the deed. You don't have to give it
 10 additional protection in order to keep it from
 11 being reverted to a park.
 12 Now to the question as to whether or not
 13 what has become our government center should
 14 have a Confederate soldier standing over,
 15 watching everybody as they go into our
 16 courthouse and into our city hall, into our
 17 public institutions. That is the conversation
 18 we are having.
 19 Now, I'm as southern as it comes. In
 20 fact, I'm so southern, I can't believe I only
 21 have three minutes. That's barely enough time
 22 for me to say hello. And my family has been
 23 here since before this monument was erected,
 24 like several other people in the room, but I
 25 don't think that this is a fair play.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 J.E.T. Bowden. He ran on the re-legalizing of
 2 prostitution.
 3 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: It's actually in
 4 the report.
 5 MR. DARE: It didn't come out when he
 6 spoke it. And so being imagined that the place
 7 is a big center of red lights and very happy
 8 women ready to get back to work, apparently.
 9 So the park has been used for many decades
 10 for public congress, obviously of different
 11 kinds. In the '50s and '60s, it was used as
 12 kind of a gay hook-up place. And the bathrooms
 13 that that happened in are still underneath that
 14 pavement. Will you memorialize that history as
 15 well because it is older than 50 years old?
 16 So I think the question on this -- nobody
 17 has asked for demolishing this monument.
 18 Nobody has asked to move the monument. This is
 19 a group of people who freaked out when they saw
 20 pavers coming up, thinking you might move some
 21 piece of Confederate history.
 22 Well, that Confederate history is not
 23 necessarily the history of Jacksonville. We
 24 were a Union-sympathizing town. We celebrated
 25 the Yankees when they came and liberated us
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 This is a way of foreclosing any public
 2 discussion over the appropriateness of that
 3 symbol. And they are not asking you to --
 4 (Timer audibly indicating speaker's
 5 three-minute time limit has expired.)
 6 MR. DARE: -- create status so much as
 7 they are asking you to stop public discussion
 8 about it. And so I hope that you turn this
 9 down.
 10 Thank you.
 11 MS. BLAKE: Conley Tipton.
 12 (Audience member approaches the podium.)
 13 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon.
 14 And my name is Conley Tipton. I live at
 15 924 Granada Boulevard South, over here in
 16 San Marco.
 17 First of all, what the monument means to
 18 me -- I was in the Vietnam Era. I come back in
 19 December of '69. I was spit on and everything
 20 else. What the monument means to me, it's not
 21 the north, the south, it is for the soldiers;
 22 black, white, Indians, and all that died.
 23 When I first come back, and the way we
 24 were treated, I had no use for America. It's
 25 like what we fought for was for nothing. We
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

21 (Pages 78 to 81)

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300



1 fought for you. Those people there died for
2 us. Right or wrong, all wars, no matter where
3 they are, there's right and there's wrong.

4 We, as soldiers, could not make that
5 decision. We did what we thought was right.
6 The north did what they thought was right, the
7 south did what they thought was right, but what
8 it represents is the dead.

9 The ones that gave their lives, they are
10 even today the real heroes. Not the ones that
11 wear the medals, and I've got quite a few
12 myself, but nevertheless, it is the ones that
13 give the ultimate sacrifice, where it's right
14 or where it's wrong at the time, because we do
15 not know those who is doing it.

16 What that represents, and it's right
17 there, it may not have been that there was a
18 battle or a war right under there, but what it
19 is is proud. And now, as we have started
20 taking the Vietnam War and brought it more up
21 to date and being more -- and more respectful,
22 instead of being spit on. They told me I
23 couldn't even get out of the plane. We had to
24 get out of the airport because they said we
25 were unfit.

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 said, anything that was historical in that
2 park, from my research as well, is long gone,
3 buried underneath an acre of pavers.

4 As far as the statue goes, I agree with
5 what a lot of other people have said here. It
6 is a statue to veterans. And Act of Congress
7 made Confederate soldiers veterans. I
8 understand the people that don't want it, and I
9 understand why, but my only thing is, I see
10 that there's -- you're never going to please
11 everybody no matter what.

12 The Confederate statue, I can see making a
13 historical landmark. I don't see the park at
14 all, because the park needs to be able to
15 evolve and change, which it can't do under a
16 landmark status.

17 That's all I have to say.

18 Thanks.

19 MS. BLAKE: Mr. Chairman, I have no more
20 cards for this item.

21 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Sir, can I ask a
22 question of you? You --

23 THE CHAIRMAN: Sir?

24 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I just wanted to
25 ask why you think that the park couldn't evolve

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 Well, this is not the situation that I
2 feel that this one little part -- and if you --
3 it's -- it's representing the ones that had
4 died. My great, great uncles and them was all
5 in the Confederate War. I don't know a lot of
6 things that happened in the War. I had no -- I
7 do not agree with -- I do not agree or disagree
8 with. I don't know. Neither did the ones
9 there, but it represents the dead of all wars
10 and the people that had given their life,
11 thinking they were for here.

12 Y'all are our bosses. And we're thinking
13 we're doing what is right, and that's all we
14 know.

15 Thank you.

16 MS. BLAKE: Roosevelt Watson.

17 AUDIENCE MEMBERS: (No response.)

18 MS. BLAKE: Nick Thompson.

19 (Audience member approaches the podium.)

20 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Good afternoon.

21 Nick Thompson, 11235 Clover Hill Circle
22 East.

23 My only thing was about trying to turn the
24 entire park into a historical landmark or
25 designation. As Wayne Wood and others have

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 if it were a landmark.

2 MR. THOMPSON: I think it would be exactly
3 what Wayne said. It would be going, jumping
4 through hoops, having to appear in front of
5 guys every time they want to do something.

6 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I don't
7 understand why you believe that, though.

8 MR. THOMPSON: Because it's not how it's
9 set up. But what's to change? How is -- what
10 is the designation? I haven't seen the
11 designation myself.

12 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: The designation
13 would be that its use as a park --

14 MR. THOMPSON: Not changing anything else?

15 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: It wouldn't be
16 protecting all those pavers and the fountains
17 and stuff. It would be protecting the
18 footprint of the park, its use as a park.

19 MR. THOMPSON: Isn't that already done
20 through the City charter and everything else
21 that's done, all the other layers of government
22 that happens in this city?

23 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: No.

24 MR. THOMPSON: Okay.

25 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: No.

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300



1 MR. THOMPSON: I still worry that, if
 2 that's the first step, what stops someone from
 3 coming in and doing the second step? And maybe
 4 that's the answer.
 5 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Well, it would
 6 have to be another process like this.
 7 MR. THOMPSON: Okay.
 8 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I just --
 9 MR. THOMPSON: I wasn't here at the
 10 beginning, so I didn't see the whole thing.
 11 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I don't mean to
 12 pick on you.
 13 MR. THOMPSON: Go ahead. Everybody picks
 14 on me.
 15 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I'm sincere in my
 16 questions because the designation is for the
 17 footprint of the park and the fact that it's a
 18 park. And that's why Joel said that at the
 19 beginning of his presentation, because --
 20 MR. THOMPSON: I wasn't here for that.
 21 Sorry.
 22 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Oh, okay,
 23 because -- the modifications being made to
 24 permanently change the use of any portion of
 25 the site in a way inconsistent with an urban
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 something, oh, no, you've got to do this
 2 exactly the way the original blueprints were or
 3 you have to do it the way the park was
 4 originally laid out, or so on and so forth.
 5 And that's where my fear is, because right now,
 6 it's a plaza. It's not even a park.
 7 This was an experiment that cities did in
 8 the '70s that was horrible. You know, they
 9 take away everything and made it concrete. I
 10 would like to see it go back to some of the
 11 other ideas that it once was instead of
 12 concrete and steel. It's even not ADA
 13 compliant, really. It's got full -- it's got
 14 stairs everywhere. So there's that problem.
 15 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Okay. Well,
 16 thank you. I appreciate it.
 17 MR. THOMPSON: You're welcome.
 18 THE CHAIRMAN: Is there anyone else to
 19 speak?
 20 MR. DARE: I have a question.
 21 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes, come up.
 22 MR. DARE: And that's --
 23 MS. MARTINAGE: Please don't speak until
 24 you come up to the microphone.
 25 MR. DARE: I know, I'm in danger of not
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 public space. So that would allow it to be
 2 relandscaped, re-hardscaped, to be used in all
 3 of the ways that the Hemming Park group wants
 4 to be able to use it. It just would prevent it
 5 from being --
 6 MR. THOMPSON: Sold?
 7 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: -- sold or not
 8 sold and used as -- as I said earlier, as a bus
 9 transfer station, or something like that.
 10 So --
 11 MR. THOMPSON: I think it was that at one
 12 time, though. I've seen pictures of it.
 13 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: So I sincerely
 14 wanted to know why you thought --
 15 MR. THOMPSON: Whenever I --
 16 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: -- that it would
 17 prevent that.
 18 MR. THOMPSON: Whenever you see anything
 19 with -- in my dealing with other things on
 20 historical landmarks, I've seen -- and since I
 21 didn't see the beginning of the presentation, I
 22 didn't know that -- I've seen it has caused
 23 these problems.
 24 Okay. We're going to make this a
 25 landmark. And then when you want to change
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 being heard.
 2 (Mr. Dare approaches the podium.)
 3 MR. DARE: Jennifer, or is it Commissioner
 4 Mansfield?
 5 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes.
 6 MR. DARE: Commissioner Mansfield, so if
 7 it's not a problem, why were these guys able to
 8 sue over the pavers?
 9 So once you landmark that, you're going to
 10 give license for a litigious group that has
 11 already proven themselves to be litigious, to
 12 come in and second-guess every change that's
 13 made in that park.
 14 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Well, I'll say
 15 that under our constitution and judicial
 16 system, everyone has a constitutional right to
 17 file a lawsuit regardless of its merits, and
 18 that my law firm subscribes to a service called
 19 Courtroom New Service that tells us about every
 20 lawsuit filed in Duval County, and I review
 21 that list on a daily basis.
 22 When I saw that case file, I pulled it up
 23 out of curiosity to read it. And frankly, I
 24 don't think it, in my personal opinion, had any
 25 merit because I don't think they had standing,
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 legal standing, to raise the issues that they
 2 were trying to raise.
 3 That being said, nothing that we do here
 4 today, whether we rule in your favor the way
 5 you want us to or not, would prevent them or
 6 anyone else from filing the same lawsuit or a
 7 similar lawsuit again because everyone can file
 8 a lawsuit. It's just what is the merits of
 9 that lawsuit.
 10 And so if we landmark it, that would not
 11 necessarily -- and legally, I don't think it
 12 would give them any more standing after that to
 13 file the lawsuit that they did. And so my
 14 answer is, we have a free court system. Anyone
 15 can always file a lawsuit. It's the merits of
 16 it. I don't think they had any standing.
 17 MR. DARE: Through the Chair, I
 18 respectfully disagree. I think you give
 19 license because you create a -- something that
 20 has happened in discussion here, but this
 21 discussion will not be remembered by every
 22 person who decides to sue because they feel
 23 like it's a change to the historic status of
 24 the park.
 25 I think you're adding an extra layer. And
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 Hart Family to the City, that it always has to
 2 be a park. So that's never going to be an
 3 issue. There's nothing to be gained by making
 4 it a landmark.
 5 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: My comment to
 6 that is, again, if we were to not deny it, that
 7 doesn't -- I mean, the fact that it was already
 8 filed when it's not a landmark kind of proves
 9 my point, not yours, but the other thing is, is
 10 that the legal -- the law books are replete
 11 with cases challenging perpetuities. The law
 12 does not favor perpetuities.
 13 So the fact that this park is supposed to
 14 remain a park in perpetuity does not give me
 15 much solace. It gives me a little bit, but not
 16 much, because there are always lawyers who will
 17 challenge that status. And also, what does it
 18 mean to be a park and free for the public can
 19 be challenged at a later time. So while it
 20 might provide some protection, it does not
 21 provide the same protection that a landmark
 22 status will.
 23 MR. WOOD: But your former argument that
 24 the lawsuit that was frivolously placed against
 25 Hemming Park worked in your favor. The fact is
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 for that reason, I just -- I just wanted to
 2 understand your reasoning on that. I don't
 3 mean to argue with you, although I enjoy
 4 arguing with you.
 5 THE CHAIRMAN: She's a great arguer, too.
 6 MR. WOOD: May I ask a question as well?
 7 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes. Come on up.
 8 (Mr. Wood approaches the podium.)
 9 MR. WOOD: Thank you.
 10 As you read that lawsuit, you may have
 11 noticed that it was based on the fact that
 12 Hemming Park -- Hemming Park had been
 13 designated as a landmark. The applicant for
 14 that lawsuit was mistaken, thinking that it had
 15 been landmarked.
 16 And he said that under oath, he had talked
 17 with Joel McEachin, and Joel said that it was a
 18 landmark. And, therefore, all of the
 19 ordinances should apply.
 20 The fact is, by making it a landmark,
 21 you're just going to open us up to more people
 22 who don't understand the law, but make it a
 23 nuisance. And it doesn't need to be a
 24 landmark. We can do our work and preserve the
 25 park, as was pointed out in the deed from the
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 that the person who filed the lawsuit did so in
 2 the belief that it was a landmark and,
 3 therefore, taking up bricks was against the
 4 law.
 5 So if it becomes a landmark, more and more
 6 people will be empowered with that same lack of
 7 understanding and could do the same. And
 8 there's just no -- I don't see any point.
 9 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: No, I don't agree
 10 with that. I don't think there's any logic to
 11 that at all.
 12 MR. WOOD: Okay. Thank you.
 13 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
 14 Let's move on.
 15 MS. MARTINAGE: To speak to -- I'm not
 16 addressing the lawsuit at all, but when a
 17 property is designated, or when a request is
 18 received to consider a property for landmark
 19 designation --
 20 MS. FETNER: Can I interrupt before you
 21 say something? We're in an active lawsuit
 22 right now.
 23 MS. MARTINAGE: Excuse me.
 24 (Mr. Shillinglaw approaches the podium.)
 25 MR. SHILLINGLAW: I just have one quick
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 question to just kind of clarify for everybody
 2 in the room. Let's pretend for a second you
 3 make the park a landmark. Are they still able
 4 to make changes or do stuff, improvement, plant
 5 trees and things like that?
 6 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Yes.
 7 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes.
 8 MR. SHILLINGLAW: And if they do, they
 9 have to come back before you and say, Hey, we
 10 want to put this, or do they go through a
 11 different planning?
 12 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Only if they
 13 want.
 14 MR. SHILLINGLAW: Because right now,
 15 they're building a restaurant or something.
 16 Something's being built there, but that's why I
 17 was -- I think some people are confused; if
 18 they do make a landmark, does it freeze
 19 everything, or are they able to build on it
 20 still.
 21 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I think what
 22 people are confusing is what they have to come
 23 to a COA for under the historic district
 24 regulations and what the landmark is.
 25 The historic district regulations, when
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 landmark, they would still be able to make
 2 improvements and things.
 3 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Of course.
 4 MR. NEWSOME: I'm sorry. I'm the one that
 5 everybody is talking about that filed the
 6 lawsuit. I was under --
 7 MS. FETNER: Can you state your name? I
 8 need you to state your name for the transcript.
 9 (Mr. Newsome approaches the podium.)
 10 MR. NEWSOME: Seber Newsome, III.
 11 I was under the misunderstanding that once
 12 the park was under designated -- was nominated,
 13 that it fell under landmark protection.
 14 Apparently not.
 15 And people said that the statue is not
 16 threatened. The Friends -- the reason I did
 17 that, The Friends of Hemming Park, at the time,
 18 had a concept drawing where the statue was no
 19 longer in the park. There was a fountain
 20 there, an interactive fountain. That's when I
 21 got involved.
 22 And statues are being threatened all over
 23 the south. So when someone says, well, nobody
 24 wants to demolish this, that's not true. It's
 25 happening. There's no law in Florida that
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 they passed the historic district, set out what
 2 you could and what you had to come for a COA
 3 for. The landmark designation is its own
 4 independent legislation. It sets that out. So
 5 modifications being made to permanently change
 6 the use of any portion of the site in a way
 7 inconsistent with an urban public space, and
 8 then B and C as well.
 9 I mean, it's -- it's limited. They --
 10 like I said, they could do their landscaping
 11 and their hardscaping.
 12 MR. SHILLINGLAW: So basically, if I own a
 13 house in Jacksonville, it becomes a historic
 14 district, and I want to add a garage, I would
 15 come to you guys for approval. If it's a
 16 landmark, that goes to a different entity for
 17 improvements. I think that's where some people
 18 might be confused. If you guys vote to make
 19 the whole park a landmark, they think that it's
 20 frozen. Like, you can't really do anything
 21 because it's a landmark.
 22 THE CHAIRMAN: Not true.
 23 MR. SHILLINGLAW: And I just want, I
 24 guess, some clarifications for other people in
 25 the room, that if they were able to make it a
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 protects statues and monuments. That's why I'm
 2 asking you, please designate the statue, not
 3 the park, a city landmark, please.
 4 Thank you.
 5 THE CHAIRMAN: Last one, and then we're
 6 going to -- I'm going to close this down.
 7 (Ms. Taylor approaches the podium.)
 8 MS. TAYLOR: Madeline Scales-Taylor. I
 9 think you have my address and everything.
 10 I have a quick question for the
 11 Commission. If the statue is designated as a
 12 landmark, must it stay in its current location?
 13 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: If they wanted to
 14 move it, it would have to have a COA.
 15 MS. TAYLOR: Okay. Our concern is that --
 16 our concern is for the statue, not that it's
 17 not a part of our history. It certainly is a
 18 part of our history. Our concern is that it
 19 has a prominent place in the government center
 20 of our city.
 21 There was no battle fought there. There
 22 was nothing historic about that site in the
 23 Civil War. It was brought there as a gift to
 24 the city, which means that the statue can stay.
 25 It can be moved anywhere. It still is a
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 commemorative statue to the Civil War.
 2 The Civil War is a part of our history.
 3 We're not negating that at all, but we're also
 4 saying that so was the civil rights movement.
 5 And there were historic events that occurred in
 6 the park.
 7 And so to keep that statue in its current
 8 location and designate it a landmark is to pour
 9 fire into the wounds of individuals in the
 10 city.
 11 Thank you.
 12 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
 13 I'm going to close the public hearing.
 14 MR. SHILLINGLAW: I just have one comment.
 15 MS. FETNER: Sir, no. We're done.
 16 THE CHAIRMAN: No. We're done. We've
 17 heard everybody.
 18 AUDIENCE MEMBER: Oh, really? Okay.
 19 (Inaudible.)
 20 MR. SHILLINGLAW: Jacksonville was
 21 occupied by Indian forces four times. So
 22 (inaudible).
 23 THE CHAIRMAN: Any discussion?
 24 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I'll make a
 25 motion to start us along.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you.
 2 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I'll move that we
 3 adopt the findings and conclusions in the
 4 report and to designate the park as well as the
 5 statue and the marker, the Kings Road marker,
 6 as set forth in the staff report.
 7 THE CHAIRMAN: Do I hear a second?
 8 COMMISSIONER DANNHEIM: Second.
 9 THE CHAIRMAN: Discussion?
 10 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Joel, how many --
 11 in your opinion, how many set of criteria does
 12 the statue alone meet? I know you have been
 13 asked that question already. I just want to
 14 refresh my memory.
 15 MR. McEACHIN: Potentially, it could meet
 16 three. I know it meets three.
 17 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Three, not four?
 18 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: But it has the
 19 support?
 20 MR. McEACHIN: Yes, but the City is not
 21 opposing the designation of the statue. So it
 22 only has to meet two.
 23 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: You know, with
 24 regard to the comment earlier about the DDRB, I
 25 mean, in the name of urban renewal, we've lost
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 at least three urban neighborhoods; the area
 2 around the stadium, LaVilla, and Brooklyn, and
 3 including the grid network of streets.
 4 Brooklyn, now, is basically turning into a
 5 suburban area. So while it's a layer they
 6 might have to go through, I think that the
 7 landmark status of the park, the square that it
 8 is, its boundaries, and its use as a park is
 9 better protected as a landmark.
 10 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Well, I have a
 11 few thoughts. You know, I commend this
 12 audience. I think this is such a healthy sign
 13 of civil discourse. And everybody's demeanor
 14 was very respectful and very committed and
 15 thoughtful. So I appreciate that.
 16 I think someone made a comment, and I
 17 think it's so true in this case. This is, in
 18 some ways, a much more global issue than what
 19 we're debating, which is the status of this
 20 place as a landmark.
 21 My role on this commission is as a
 22 professional. I'm an architect. So my initial
 23 reaction to everything really comes from that
 24 point of view. And so I'm looking at urban
 25 fabric and design. And I am not as focused on
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 these issues of history, which is not -- which
 2 is why this commission has a broad group of
 3 people. There are historical -- there are
 4 historians, and there's architects and lawyers.
 5 There's lots of different folks who sit up
 6 here, but in my role as an architect, I look at
 7 the park.
 8 And I really respect the concern that
 9 there's nothing -- none of the original
 10 historic fabric is there. None of the first
 11 two, at least, versions of the park. And what
 12 is there is really a disappointing kind of
 13 moment from the '70s, I guess.
 14 I was involved deeply with San Marco. And
 15 I do have to say, you know, a lot of what we
 16 did in San Marco, when we got rid of their
 17 original fountain and their public art there,
 18 we moved it, since then, the neighborhood group
 19 has reconceived that park.
 20 And all of that really spoke to kind of a
 21 more organic, dynamic movement in the City. So
 22 I am hesitant to draw a rectangle around this
 23 square and call it a landmark. I think it
 24 would be great if it was restored in some way,
 25 but I don't think that we are necessarily the
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 body that is most appropriate to review
 2 improvements to the park.
 3 The park belongs to the City. It no
 4 longer has a historic fabric. And our role is
 5 in evaluating what's done there, if we come at
 6 it from the prospective of what's historically
 7 appropriate, I think we may limit the
 8 possibilities that allow it to become a more
 9 vibrant -- a more vibrant place for the City to
 10 inhabit. So I have concerns as a professional
 11 and as an architect.

12 On the subject of the monument itself,
 13 it's a very fine piece of public art. There's
 14 very entrenched opinions about whether it
 15 belongs in this place or not. I personally
 16 think when it come to public art, there's
 17 plenty of examples of history that is
 18 recognized, and there's monuments to it, and
 19 there's ethical judgments on whether it's good
 20 or bad, but I don't think we're here to make
 21 those.

22 I think we can look at the Andrew Jackson
 23 statue that's on Laura Street, and a lot of
 24 folks who go, that guy was not a good guy, and
 25 we should not be named Jacksonville. So I
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 DDRB, and the other agencies, and the City
 2 itself has a vested interest in maintaining it
 3 as a park.
 4 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Well, I'm glad
 5 for your comments, Angela. Let me clarify my
 6 motion, because the motion, like I said, they
 7 can do the landscaping and the hardscaping.
 8 The motion was to adopt the report. And the
 9 report says "modifications being made to
 10 permanently change the use of any portion of
 11 the site inconsistent with an urban public
 12 space." So that's the use of the park.

13 So yeah, if they wanted to use it for
 14 something other than a park, they'd need a COA
 15 for that. The relocation, modification,
 16 restoration or any other work conducted on the
 17 Confederate monument or the coquina marker
 18 commemorating Old Kings Road that conflict,
 19 potentially conflict with the Secretary of
 20 Interior standards, you would need a COA for
 21 that, too.

22 And then there's a catchall of any work
 23 the Department determines to be in conflict or
 24 potentially in conflict with any of the
 25 applicable Secretary standards, but the way
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 don't think the ethical judgment on whether a
 2 piece of public art or a monument should come
 3 into question.

4 Should the monument be preserved because
 5 of its history, and the time, and the things
 6 that records good or bad, I think so. I think
 7 the monument has merit as a historical marker
 8 and as a -- and also as, you know, a record of
 9 what the entire country did in terms of
 10 memorials after the Civil War. That was a real
 11 shift in how we remember the dead. And these
 12 memorials were placed all over the country in
 13 the north and the south.

14 And so that is something that I think is a
 15 valid piece of history and worthy of
 16 recognizing. So that's my opinion. My opinion
 17 is professional.

18 I think the park, it is a challenge for me
 19 to support that, honestly, and I think it could
 20 be limiting to -- it is a hassle. It's another
 21 application. It's another process for them to
 22 go through.

23 And I don't necessarily think the history
 24 of this rectangle is threatened. I think it's
 25 a valuable piece of City real estate. And the
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 that's written, it means that if you wanted to
 2 change the use, you'd need a COA. If you want
 3 to change or modify or restore the Confederate
 4 monument or the Coquina marker, you need a COA.
 5 I don't read this as requiring a COA for other
 6 things.

7 MS. SHEPPARD: To piggyback on that,
 8 before you get to the A, B, and C, probably the
 9 more important thing is that it clearly
 10 outlines. As can be the case under a landmark
 11 designation, the ordinance clearly says you
 12 define what requires a COA. And that's what
 13 Joel attempted to do in this report.

14 The very first statement on Page 3 is
 15 routine repairs, maintenance, minor
 16 alterations, temporary new construction,
 17 events, activities in the park. None of that
 18 requires a COA at all. Like, they don't even
 19 have to come to us and fill out paperwork.

20 So, I mean, that was supposed to kind of
 21 capture all these, you know, concerns about it
 22 being limiting and another layer, and really,
 23 put the emphasis on, we're talking about a COA
 24 for something extreme, like the removal of the
 25 statue, which you don't have to decide today.

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 That would be a COA that we would come back to
2 you, and you would consider the criteria at
3 that point in time as to whether or not that
4 would be something that you would want to
5 approve, but we did try to address that because
6 that, you know, was a concern.

7 And that is something that you're able to
8 do through the landmark report. And you may
9 even have some opportunity -- I don't know,
10 I'll ask General Counsel -- to -- if you want
11 to further tweak that, I mean, you could
12 potentially do that.

13 MS. FETNER: Yes. You could absolutely
14 tweak it however you'd like. Those are just
15 recommendations from the staff on how to handle
16 it. So you can make whatever conditions you
17 would like.

18 The only thing that we have to do on my
19 end with the bill is waive certain provisions
20 of the code that require, you know, the
21 strict -- the strict process for COAs when
22 you're dealing with, I think the language is,
23 alterations to any external feature on the
24 landmarked site. So I just had -- it's just
25 kind of like a waiver to say, these are the
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 at it as, you know, how many criteria does it
2 meet first. And, to me, it -- it -- it doesn't
3 meet four. I think it -- I think it certainly
4 may meet two, but -- maybe three. I don't
5 think it does have, as Wayne Wood said, the
6 park itself.

7 So is it suitable for preservation and
8 restoration in the terms that most of its
9 historical kind of, you know, context has been
10 changed. So I don't really see it meeting Item
11 G.

12 And I think Item C, kind of connecting it
13 to Isaiah David Hart, I think, just because he
14 laid out the grid and put the -- I think that's
15 a stretch. I'm not -- you know, once it
16 doesn't meet four, you know, there's -- it's
17 really kind of, you know, not worth the
18 argument at that point, but I just don't think
19 it meets the criteria, the park itself.

20 That being said, I -- there's even more
21 reason behind that. You know, I mean, I agree
22 with a lot of what Angela said about, you know,
23 not wanting to kind of -- you know, giving --
24 giving kind of the -- you know, the community
25 the kind of flexibility to kind of do what it
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 actual conditions for this specific landmark
2 site.

3 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: But that would
4 have happened. Based on my motion and our
5 discussion today, that would happen when you
6 draft the legislation.

7 MS. FETNER: Right, because it's going in
8 just as Joel wrote in his conditions.

9 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Yeah.

10 MR. McEACHIN: I'd like to make a
11 clarification about ownership and the City's
12 responsibility as far as what they do with the
13 park.

14 There was consideration of actually
15 putting the state -- I mean, the federal
16 courthouse and the post office back in the
17 1880s on that park. So the research was done
18 and come to find out, the City owns this park
19 outright. They can do whatever they want with
20 it. They can sell it. They can -- you know,
21 it's a piece of land just like any other public
22 piece of land. It does not have to be given
23 back to the Hart family.

24 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: You know, I -- you
25 know, as a commissioner here, you know, I look
Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300

1 would like to to make it more of a -- kind of a
2 park that kind of contributes to the city.

3 And not kind of getting in the way of
4 that, I think is important. And so, you know,
5 I wouldn't be in support of -- of, you know,
6 landmarking the park itself as a rectangle. I
7 would not.

8 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Well, let me --
9 let me ask you why not, just like I did to the
10 gentleman, the unfortunate gentleman that I
11 picked on. Why not?

12 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Because I agree
13 with what Wayne Wood said about Item Number G.
14 I don't think -- I think the fabric, a majority
15 of the fabric has been stripped away. And so
16 its suitability for preservation or restoration
17 does not exist.

18 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: But wait, wait,
19 wait. No. He -- the motion is to designate
20 the park in its configuration as a block. It's
21 not preserving the fountain and the bricks and
22 all of that. In fact, it's specifically saying
23 that it's not preserving all of that. So I
24 just don't understand what you mean by it
25 getting in the way.

Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
(904) 821-0300



1 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Here's my
 2 challenge with this, is that when -- you know,
 3 if -- if 30 years down the road, and we've
 4 solved our pension problems, and we can have a
 5 major park restoration, I don't know that
 6 we're -- this body, with our guidelines, are
 7 necessarily the right people to have oversight
 8 on what -- how the park is improved at that
 9 point. I don't feel like it -- you know,
 10 because the fabric has been so dramatically
 11 changed, it's not a historic park anymore.
 12 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: But the only way
 13 that comes before us is if they want to --
 14 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Right.
 15 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: -- restore or
 16 modify --
 17 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Yeah. If they
 18 have a major restoration.
 19 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: -- the
 20 Confederate monument or the coquina marker.
 21 That's the only thing that would come before
 22 us.
 23 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Well, then
 24 we're just designating the marker and the
 25 monument.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: I mean, are we --
 2 THE CHAIRMAN: Can we maybe change the
 3 semantics a little bit and not call it a park,
 4 but maintain -- mandate it as a, quote, open
 5 space, in lieu of a landmark, as an open space
 6 instead of a, quote, park?
 7 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: I just don't think
 8 the Commission -- it's the Commission's
 9 business to landmark this, Hemming Park as a
 10 rectangle. I don't think it's our business.
 11 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I don't know.
 12 It's in the original plat made by the founder
 13 of the city. I don't think it gets much more
 14 historical than that.
 15 And the fact that the statue glowed red
 16 during the fire was the only thing in the path
 17 of the fire that survived. Again, I don't
 18 think it gets much more historical than that.
 19 Frankly, it could be a bell on top of that
 20 instead of a soldier, but it's the significance
 21 of it being there over time in the central
 22 park. I fail to see how it's anything but the
 23 probability of the most historic thing in
 24 downtown.
 25 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: I totally -- I
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: No, no.
 2 COMMISSIONER UNDERWOOD: May I address
 3 something? You know, hypothetically, if the
 4 City doesn't meet its pension and the City
 5 decides, we want to sell the park to a
 6 developer and build a multistory building right
 7 there, they can. And Friends of the Park don't
 8 have their park. And Confederates don't --
 9 nobody has a park.
 10 The only thing that locks this into
 11 remaining a park is to designate it.
 12 Otherwise, the City has the ability to solve a
 13 pension problem, like any financial problem, by
 14 offering this up for sale.
 15 Is that correct or incorrect?
 16 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Just, the City is
 17 going to sell the park argument like, to me,
 18 is -- like doesn't -- I just -- I don't -- I
 19 just don't get that. I don't get that
 20 argument.
 21 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I wouldn't have
 22 thought that they would plow over entire
 23 neighborhoods of the community either like,
 24 LaVilla and Brooklyn, and have the stadium
 25 either. So I don't know if we can guarantee --
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 completely agree with that. And I love that
 2 idea. What I'd like to do is, take the COA
 3 process -- and I know what you're saying. It's
 4 such a limited application, but honestly, in
 5 practical terms, if there's any modifications,
 6 it's a -- it's a vehicle for people to, you
 7 know, create obstacles.
 8 And I think that's the challenge here is,
 9 how do you -- on a practical level, you know,
 10 they're not going to do away with that
 11 rectangle, but I -- and I appreciate the fact
 12 that it -- you know, it is -- it is part of the
 13 City grid. And I'm very sensitive to that.
 14 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I mean, we have a
 15 Skyway on it now. And who's to say they're not
 16 going to put a similar thing on the other side,
 17 or on one of the other sides of the park.
 18 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: I mean, let the
 19 DDRB handle that.
 20 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: But they're not
 21 bound by the landmark regulations. And I think
 22 I pretty well explained why, you know, a few
 23 years from now, who knows what DDRB is going to
 24 say is a good idea.
 25 In fact, if a developer came in here and
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 said they could solve the pension problem and
 2 create a tower downstairs that would create
 3 thousands of jobs downtown, you don't think
 4 there'd be some serious discussion about that
 5 actually happening?
 6 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: I don't. I don't
 7 think that.
 8 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Yeah.
 9 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: I think that's --
 10 come on.
 11 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Let's continue.
 12 COMMISSIONER DANNHEIM: I just have one
 13 more really quick comment. Although the space
 14 has evolved, it has been a designated historic
 15 space. I mean, it's just -- to me, it's a
 16 simple matter of our ability to landmark
 17 something that will perpetuate history in a
 18 downtown location.
 19 And I'm the first to be open to
 20 considering any COA that would be made to
 21 improve upon or add, or, you know, but, to me,
 22 the threat of what's already happened in our
 23 downtown and the fact that we have not
 24 successfully designated a larger area of
 25 downtown as a historic district is -- is very
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 it's not an original feature. I mean, you
 2 know, every day, we're signing off on
 3 demolition work of a non-historic feature.
 4 For the park, when we were under the
 5 impression -- or at least some of us were under
 6 the impression there might be some momentary
 7 protection while it was going through the
 8 review process, we did a COA for the work that
 9 they were doing in the park when they were
 10 doing the groundwork with the pavers and stuff
 11 because that's not something that would concern
 12 us, just like when somebody is redoing a
 13 driveway in the historic district, but this is
 14 saying that we wouldn't even do the COA at that
 15 point. We would just sign off on a permit if
 16 one was even directed to us.
 17 If it was something like that, it may not
 18 even require a permit. And we probably
 19 wouldn't see it anyway because this is saying
 20 we don't have to see it in any kind of way when
 21 it's something that's, you know, of that level.
 22 I mean, it even allows for minor alterations.
 23 So there's nothing historic about a lot of
 24 the park, which would make it very easy for
 25 them to do all of those things. It would only
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 concerning in a city with such history, such a
 2 long history as Jacksonville.
 3 So anyway, just my thoughts.
 4 THE CHAIRMAN: Commissioners, I was also
 5 remiss in calling to your attention that we
 6 have two e-mails from concerned citizens, also.
 7 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Let me ask you,
 8 let's talk about C, because C is this kind of
 9 open-ended -- on how the COA process would be
 10 applied.
 11 Any other work which the Department
 12 determines to be in conflict or potentially in
 13 conflict with any applicable Secretary
 14 standards. And we're talking about the
 15 Secretary of Interior standards. And which
 16 standards are we going to apply to this park?
 17 I mean, are there historic park standards? I
 18 mean, I know the guidelines --
 19 MS. SHEPPARD: It's just the ten
 20 standards, but I think most of the standards
 21 deal with the retention and preservation of
 22 historic fabric.
 23 So just like, you know, we regularly sign
 24 off on things that have already been impacted.
 25 And we don't hold it to the same standards if
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 be one of those extreme cases where they're
 2 going to do something major. And, you know, it
 3 is up to the City. If you think that whatever
 4 they're doing is fine, you would just approve
 5 it, I mean, if there was something that we felt
 6 needed to go to you.
 7 I mean, as the Commission, in Chapter 76,
 8 it says you are advisory. So if nothing else,
 9 if you had some architectural things that --
 10 you know, they do have to consider this and
 11 that, y'all have great opinions on things that
 12 the DDRB regularly uses when they end up
 13 getting it after the fact.
 14 But if you just wanted to -- you know,
 15 anything that would rise to the level of coming
 16 to the Commission -- and I don't really
 17 perceive that being very much, in all honestly,
 18 just based on how it's set up. I mean, you
 19 could look at it and say that's fine and done.
 20 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Looks fine, but
 21 looks fine based on what? Based on the
 22 historical something? I mean --
 23 MS. SHEPPARD: We write reports all the
 24 time. There is no historic fabric that is
 25 being affected in this project. And,
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 therefore, we're recommending approval. And
 2 again, that's only in extreme case of it even
 3 getting to you guys.
 4 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Right, but don't
 5 you see --
 6 MS. SHEPPARD: And that's -- that really
 7 is rising to the level of moving the monument.
 8 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: In my mind, it's
 9 like, why force them to even go through that
 10 extra layer of bureaucracy? There's already
 11 the DDRB there. If there's not a historic
 12 question.
 13 MS. SHEPPARD: How is there a layer of
 14 bureaucracy when they're not even being told
 15 they have to come to us? I don't understand
 16 how that's a layer if the majority of the
 17 things that you would do in the park doesn't
 18 even require review.
 19 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: But some do.
 20 MS. SHEPPARD: And part of the landmark's
 21 process is to provide recognition to spaces and
 22 sites. Not structures, necessarily, but to
 23 sites. You don't even have to have a
 24 structure. It can just be a plot of land.
 25 That's why it's the National Register of
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Joel, on that James
 2 Weldon Johnson -- and I don't expect you to
 3 remember this, but do you? On that where it
 4 was just dirt/grass --
 5 MR. McEACHIN: Yes.
 6 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: -- did it get --
 7 did it -- did it -- would you have had it meet
 8 Item G, it's suitability for preservation or
 9 restoration? Would you have included that, do
 10 you think?
 11 MR. McEACHIN: I don't remember. I didn't
 12 write that report --
 13 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Okay.
 14 MR. McEACHIN: -- believe it or not.
 15 And -- but it wouldn't -- you know, I think the
 16 real concern about the reason the -- it was
 17 actually -- the designation of the James Weldon
 18 Johnson site was actually requested by the
 19 mayor.
 20 The concern was to ensure that that
 21 property stayed in a manner that it can be used
 22 to commemorate James Weldon Johnson and the
 23 City does not turn around and trade it off for
 24 a big development project. And that was --
 25 that was the reason it was designated.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 Historic Places and not structures.
 2 So, I mean, you are the official body of
 3 the City that is supposed to be tasked with
 4 determining whether something has historic
 5 value. And that's really, you know, what
 6 you're determining to be the landmark.
 7 And, you know, if it comes down to just
 8 being the space, that is why you have the
 9 ability under a landmark to make it more
 10 defined in that space.
 11 MR. McEACHIN: A similar situation that
 12 the Commission faced was with the James Weldon
 13 Johnson site. And the Commission and the City
 14 Council did designate that as a landmark.
 15 There's nothing on that piece of property but
 16 dirt.
 17 The significance to the community, that
 18 James Weldon Johnson was born there, and the
 19 significance that Lift Every Voice and Sing was
 20 actually wrote right there is important, but
 21 the real significance of being designated is
 22 that the Commission is in a position to ensure
 23 that that property is not used in an improper
 24 way to commemorate the life of James Weldon
 25 Johnson.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: You know, I would
 2 like to say for purposes of the record that I
 3 do believe that G is met, because the
 4 suitability for preservation is -- there's
 5 nothing more suitable than keeping this as a
 6 park. I mean, even the opponents of
 7 landmarking say it should remain to be a park.
 8 And that's what's being preserved.
 9 And it is completely suitable for
 10 preserving it as a park. There's nothing
 11 opposing the ability to keep it as a park and
 12 to keep it in the four corners that it has.
 13 COMMISSIONER UNDERWOOD: And if I
 14 understand right, there's nothing making it --
 15 designating it as a landmark. There's nothing
 16 that's telling anybody or any entity that it
 17 has to retain, you know, what it looked like in
 18 the 1800s --
 19 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: No.
 20 COMMISSIONER UNDERWOOD: -- or the early
 21 1900s, or the 1950s. It's just that it has to
 22 remain a public park.
 23 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: But very often,
 24 when improvements are made, that is kind of the
 25 default position of our report. It defaults to
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 sort of a historicism, which good or bad may
 2 not be --
 3 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Well, I mean, I
 4 said this a number of times. And so I can
 5 modify my motion so it says it in here, again,
 6 but the thing is, is that I don't think
 7 landscaping work comes to us. And that's what
 8 Lisa was just saying, is the land- -- you know,
 9 landscaping, hardscaping --
 10 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: What do you
 11 foresee under that as coming to us
 12 specifically? Relocating the monument?
 13 MR. McEACHIN: Relocating the monument
 14 would definitely go to the Commission.
 15 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: What other
 16 things would come before us?
 17 COMMISSIONER UNDERWOOD: Let me ask an
 18 example. My understanding, right now, there's
 19 a restaurant or something that's trying to go
 20 in there. And it's not a permanent restaurant.
 21 It's just a temporary structure. If this was
 22 designated as a landmark, would that temporary
 23 structure to be a restaurant have to come
 24 before us?
 25 MS. SHEPPARD: The very first sentence on
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 comfortable explaining, we could put it on the
 2 record and put it in the motion. It's very
 3 vague.
 4 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: It's a very
 5 challenging --
 6 MS. FETNER: Does it mean -- does
 7 "temporary" mean 30 days, or does it mean that
 8 it could be removed 10 years from now with
 9 little issue, you know.
 10 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Right.
 11 COMMISSIONER UNDERWOOD: Is that not
 12 covered in our Temporary Structures Committee?
 13 MS. FETNER: No, because it's not a
 14 flexible material.
 15 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: We've had
 16 issues on temporary before. That's why the
 17 term gave me pause, because I don't -- you
 18 know, if the restaurant box is a temporary
 19 structure, it doesn't come before us, but I
 20 think it's somewhat of an open-ended
 21 interpretation.
 22 THE CHAIRMAN: I mean, if they're selling
 23 stuff out of it, I would think it would require
 24 some kind of a permit.
 25 COMMISSIONER HACKLEY: I have a question.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 Page 3 -- I'm sorry -- in response to
 2 Commissioner Underwood, routine -- routine
 3 repairs and maintenance, minor alterations,
 4 temporary new construction, events, activities
 5 of the park will not require a COA.
 6 So, I mean, all the stuff that regularly
 7 occurs in the park, you know, stages go up,
 8 stages go down, you know --
 9 COMMISSIONER UNDERWOOD: Temporary
 10 restaurants?
 11 MS. SHEPPARD: Yeah. I mean, all those
 12 things would be -- fall into that category. I
 13 think that if there was a major -- you know, I
 14 don't know. If they were going to recreate
 15 the -- what's one of the features that used to
 16 be in the park? A bandstand or something, I
 17 mean, that might (inaudible) access, the DDRB
 18 would probably want your opinion on, you know,
 19 if they were going to do something like that,
 20 but again --
 21 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Do you have a
 22 definition for "temporary" in your guidelines
 23 or your --
 24 MS. FETNER: For temporary? I don't
 25 believe so. If that's something you would feel
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 If the owner is sending a letter to not
 2 designate it, if it is approved, and there's a
 3 marker, who pays for the marker? You know, the
 4 landmark marker, who pays for that?
 5 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Well, you
 6 don't -- you don't automatically get a marker
 7 for that. So it's whoever wants to buy it.
 8 They're usually donated by someone.
 9 MS. SHEPPARD: There's no requirement to
 10 have one. I think most landmark structures do
 11 not have a marker unless the owner wanted them.
 12 I think the current markers in the park
 13 hopefully speak enough to the history.
 14 COMMISSIONER DANNHEIM: I have a question
 15 about the process. Going back to the process,
 16 before -- if we were to designate the park as a
 17 landmark, it would then go to City Council for
 18 a vote; although, they have already made their
 19 petition that they are not in favor of this
 20 designation?
 21 MS. FETNER: It's not -- it's the City
 22 Parks Department that made the opposition of
 23 declaring the entire park as a landmark. Once
 24 you make your recommendation, then Council
 25 votes on it --
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 COMMISSIONER DANNHEIM: Okay.
 2 MS. FETNER: -- separately.
 3 COMMISSIONER DANNHEIM: Okay.
 4 MS. FETNER: And it goes through the
 5 normal council process.
 6 COMMISSIONER DANNHEIM: Okay.
 7 THE CHAIRMAN: Jennifer, can we come up
 8 with a revised motion that would cover some of
 9 the concerns?
 10 MR. KILLINGSWORTH: Mr. Chairman, can I
 11 speak?
 12 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes, sir. Come on up.
 13 (Mr. Killingsworth approaches he podium.)
 14 MR. KILLINGSWORTH: Bill Killingsworth.
 15 I'm the Director the Planning Department.
 16 If it would please the Commission, the
 17 Department is okay -- and I believe the intent
 18 was, in terms of the park, if the Commission so
 19 desired to recommend landmarking the park, that
 20 only modifications that permanently changed it
 21 from being used as a public space would require
 22 a COA, and relocation, modification,
 23 restoration of the Confederate monument and the
 24 coquina.
 25 So in terms -- it was not the intention
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 connotation when you're thinking of design
 2 issues. I'm not that crazy about the term
 3 "urban" either. I don't know if it's civic or
 4 just open space, but -- you know, because
 5 "urban" does lead you into this kind of plaza
 6 notion as opposed to a park.
 7 THE CHAIRMAN: Yeah.
 8 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: What's your
 9 suggestion?
 10 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: I don't know if
 11 it can be a civic space or just the open.
 12 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Maybe we should
 13 just strike the word "urban" and just say
 14 "public space."
 15 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: "Public space"
 16 is great. Let's do that.
 17 MS. FETNER: Are you going to restate your
 18 motion, just so we can --
 19 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I can if you want
 20 me to.
 21 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes, she will.
 22 MS. FETNER: I knew she was.
 23 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Okay. I'll
 24 restate my motion to -- for LS-16-01, that we
 25 adopt the report and recommendation prepared by
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 for routine repairs or even permanent
 2 structures to require a COA, only that the use
 3 be maintained as a public space. So anything
 4 that's consistent with an urban public space,
 5 whether it's a restaurant, playground
 6 equipment, concessionaires, bandstands,
 7 whatever it might be, if it's consistent with
 8 an urban public space, it would not need a COA.
 9 So if that pleases the Commission and the
 10 motion wants to clarify that, the Department
 11 would be okay with that.
 12 I would also add that if the Commission
 13 feels that Item C is too broad, the Department
 14 is fine if you wish to strike it.
 15 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Thank you. Thank
 16 you, sir. I was actually thinking that very
 17 thing, to strike C.
 18 THE CHAIRMAN: Uh-huh.
 19 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: I'm not
 20 comfortable with C.
 21 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Yeah. I'll
 22 modify my motion to strike C from Page 3.
 23 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: And can we
 24 strike -- you know, urban -- this is, again, an
 25 architect thing. "Urban" has a certain
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 City staff and recommend designation as a
 2 landmark of the Hemming Park, the Confederate
 3 monument and the coquina marker.
 4 And I want to emphasize in my motion,
 5 Page 3 of the report. Routine repairs and
 6 maintenance, minor alterations, temporary new
 7 construction, events and activities in the park
 8 will not require a COA.
 9 However, the following work would require
 10 an approved COA application: A modification
 11 being made to permanently change the use of any
 12 portion of the site in a way inconsistent with
 13 a public space, or B, relocation, modification,
 14 restoration or any other work conducted on the
 15 Confederate monument or the coquina marker
 16 commemorating Old Kings Road in conflict, or
 17 potentially in conflict, with the Secretary of
 18 Interior standards, and that any other
 19 modifications not listed do not require a COA.
 20 MS. FETNER: Do you want that in the
 21 motion?
 22 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Yes.
 23 THE CHAIRMAN: Uh-huh.
 24 MS. FETNER: So you want that on the bill,
 25 any other work not listed above does not
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 require a COA?
 2 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Yes. I would
 3 like to point out as a comment, though, that
 4 wouldn't prevent someone, then, from coming to
 5 us for an Opinion of Appropriateness. And I
 6 encourage people to do that because I think it
 7 often has good results.
 8 MS. FETNER: Do you want the encouragement
 9 of opinions, or is that --
 10 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Sure. I'll put
 11 that as part of my motion.
 12 MS. FETNER: Okay.
 13 THE CHAIRMAN: Do I hear a second?
 14 COMMISSIONER UNDERWOOD: Second.
 15 THE CHAIRMAN: All those in favor of the
 16 motion?
 17 Aye.
 18 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Aye.
 19 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Aye.
 20 COMMISSIONER DANNHEIM: Aye.
 21 COMMISSIONER UNDERWOOD: Aye.
 22 THE CHAIRMAN: Those opposed?
 23 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Nay.
 24 COMMISSIONER HACKLEY: Nay.
 25 THE CHAIRMAN: So then Commissioner
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 THE CHAIRMAN: Then we'll call you up.
 2 MR. McEACHIN: Okay. This particular COA
 3 application was first heard at the April 27th
 4 meeting. It was deferred from that meeting. I
 5 think there was some -- some suggestions about
 6 how she might be able to approach what she --
 7 what the applicant is trying to achieve and --
 8 but it's been deferred long enough that the
 9 Commission wanted to bring it forward and see
 10 if some action can be done on it.
 11 This application is to modify a window on
 12 the west elevation into a doorway. The window
 13 in question is one right here. Now, this would
 14 be, actually, the first window on that side
 15 elevation, because the porch itself has been
 16 enclose the. Actually, I take that back. It's
 17 right here. Sorry. It's right here. This is
 18 an enclosed porch.
 19 The opening that they are proposing
 20 enclosing -- I'm sorry. I keep saying
 21 "enclosing." It's actually to convert it into
 22 a doorway. I still haven't gotten my mind off
 23 Hemming Plaza yet. It's converted into a
 24 doorway.
 25 And again, like I said, it's the window
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 Allmand voted nay, and Hackley.
 2 So one, two, three, four -- five yeas, two
 3 nays.
 4 MS. FETNER: The motion passes.
 5 THE CHAIRMAN: Correct. The motion
 6 passes.
 7 Let's take a ten-minute break.
 8 (Brief recess.)
 9 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. We're reconvening.
 10 Thank you for your patience.
 11 We are going to move on to Certificates of
 12 Appropriateness. The first one we're going to
 13 hear is COA-16-318, at 3637 Valencia Road.
 14 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Chairman, I
 15 want to declare ex-parte communication on this
 16 item.
 17 The applicant had called me after the
 18 first time it appeared before us and asked me
 19 to meet her at the site, so I did that and
 20 looked at the house.
 21 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Staff, can we have a
 22 report?
 23 MS. FETNER: Ma'am, you can sit down until
 24 they call you up because staff is going to give
 25 a report.
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 right here. At one time, that was the first
 2 window on the side because the porch itself was
 3 open. And as you can see, it's still with a
 4 sash-like window.
 5 The applicant is proposing to take the
 6 window out, modify it into an entryway and to
 7 utilize, I think, a French-style door. Also,
 8 to construct a landing. The landing itself
 9 would have stairs parallel to the sidewall. I
 10 do not have any drawings or representations of
 11 that landing or any kind of cover that might go
 12 over that doorway as well.
 13 The objective in doing this is to provide
 14 an easier and safer outlet from the house to
 15 the front yard and also provide better access
 16 for a disabled family member that frequents
 17 the -- frequently visits the residence, because
 18 the front, as you saw, had some very high
 19 steps. And also, the elevation raises here,
 20 too.
 21 So the property is listed as a
 22 contributing property in the Riverside Avondale
 23 Historic District. It was built in circa 1924.
 24 It reflects elements of Craftsman Revival
 25 style. The major alteration to the building,
 Diane M. Tropa, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300



1 perfect. I think it should -- it's about time.
 2 It should be raised, seriously.
 3 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Well, you know,
 4 I wonder because there are staff things.
 5 You've still got to write a report.
 6 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: Yeah.
 7 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: And, you know,
 8 I know they're much simpler, but maybe there
 9 should be a 25 or \$35 token fee just to take
 10 some of the pressure off some of these other --
 11 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: I like the -- I
 12 like the -- the ones that staff approval can do
 13 not charging anything because it encourages
 14 compliance. It encourages them to do something
 15 that doesn't require it to come here, i.e., to
 16 follow the rules.
 17 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: But it may help
 18 offset the pressure on just the ones you're
 19 talking about that people go, I'll just build
 20 that and see if I get caught.
 21 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: They don't do a
 22 whole written report on those. They just mark
 23 the form approved.
 24 THE CHAIRMAN: Uh-huh.
 25 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: I mean --
 Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 addendum, is a design issue regarding
 2 gaslights. Do you care? Do you want to see
 3 it?
 4 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: No.
 5 MS. MARTINAGE: Can we approve it at staff
 6 level?
 7 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Yep.
 8 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Yes. Those
 9 things are so expensive, the 12 people who can
 10 afford to put them in.
 11 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Well, the thing
 12 is, is that I don't think they're necessarily
 13 really appropriate for Riverside Avondale,
 14 perhaps Springfield, but the reality is, if you
 15 put one up, what are you going to do, one,
 16 maybe two in your front yard? I mean, it's
 17 not -- it's --
 18 THE CHAIRMAN: Yeah.
 19 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: -- pick and
 20 choose your battles.
 21 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. We're adjourned.
 22 (The above proceedings adjourned at
 23 9:25 p.m.)
 24 - - -
 25 Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.
 2 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: I get it, but
 3 there's -- there's all kinds of things at the
 4 Building Department you've got to pay \$25 for.
 5 I mean, they do have -- on the third floor --
 6 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Yeah.
 7 COMMISSIONER ALLMAND: -- they've got a
 8 tax collector for that reason.
 9 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: Well, \$25 is
 10 certainly better than 315.
 11 COMMISSIONER SCHIFANELLA: Yeah, that's
 12 what I mean. Just a little something so that
 13 next year, they don't have to go to
 14 (inaudible). Yeah, it's tough.
 15 THE CHAIRMAN: Do we have anything from
 16 the Solar Committee or no?
 17 COMMISSIONER MANSFIELD: We -- yeah. The
 18 consultant that we met -- that met with us
 19 originally wants to join us for the next
 20 meeting, and we've just been having trouble
 21 coordinating with dates. We think just one
 22 more meeting, we'll be done.
 23 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. No other issues?
 24 MS. MARTINAGE: One last issue very,
 25 very -- very, very quickly, it's on the
 Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300

1 CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER
 2
 3 STATE OF FLORIDA)
 4)
 5 COUNTY OF DUVAL)
 6
 7 I, Diane M. Tropia, Florida Professional
 8 Reporter, certify that I was authorized to and did
 9 stenographically report the foregoing proceedings and
 10 that the transcript is a true and complete record of my
 11 stenographic notes.
 12
 13
 14
 15 DATED this 7th day of August 2016.
 16
 17 _____
 18 Diane M. Tropia
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25 Diane M. Tropia, Inc., P.O. Box 2375, Jacksonville, FL 32203
 (904) 821-0300